Holy night

How the Christmas story calls Catholics to action
NEW BOOKS FROM
Ave Maria Press

Catholic Hipster: The Next Level
How Some Awesomely Obscure Stuff Helps Us Live Our Faith with Passion
TOMMY TIGHE
224 pages, $15.95

Abide in the Heart of Christ
JOE LARAMEE, S.J.
160 pages, $14.95

The Flowing Grace of Now
Encountering Wisdom through the Weeks of the Year
MACRINA WIEDERKEHR, O.S.B.
256 pages, $16.95

Becoming Women of the Word
SARAH CHRISTMYER
160 pages, $15.95

Exalted
SONJA CORBITT
192 pages, $16.95

NEW BOOKS FROM
Ave Maria Press

The Church and the Roman Empire
(301-490)
MICHAEL WHITE AND TOM CORCORAN
192 pages, $17.95

Virgin, Mother, Queen
ROBERT L. FASTIGGI and MICHAEL O'NEILL
192 pages, $17.95

The Early Church
(33-313)
KATHRYN WHITAKER
160 pages, $15.95

A Book of Saints for Catholic Moms
352 pages, $18.95

The Handbook for Catholic Moms
256 pages, $17.95

Feature: Holy families
by Amanda Hendler-Voss
The Holy Family's flight from Egypt parallels the journey of modern-day migrants.

Feature: Awaken Advent
by Father John Christman, S.S.S.
Here are four art meditations for the Advent season.

Poem: Spheres
by Fred Dings

Expert Witness
Mix and match an interview with Samira Menta interfaith families celebrate the holidays in unique and meaningful ways.

Essay: Upstairs, downstairs church
by Sister Rhonda Miske, O.P.
During the holidays, community blossoms outside the sanctuary.

Essay: A great gift
by Jessie Bazan
Let your words be made flesh.

ChurchMoney
MICHAEL WHITE AND TOM CORCORAN
224 pages, $16.95

Becoming Women of the Word
SARAH CHRISTMYER
160 pages, $15.95

Updated Editions
by LISA M. HENDEY

Virgin, Mother, Queen
ROBERT L. FASTIGGI and MICHAEL O'NEILL
192 pages, $17.95

The Early Church
(33-313)
KATHRYN WHITAKER
160 pages, $15.95

Live Big, Love Bigger
KATHRYN WHITAKER
160 pages, $15.95

A Book of Saints for Catholic Moms
352 pages, $18.95

The Handbook for Catholic Moms
256 pages, $17.95

Poem: Spheres
by Fred Dings

Expert Witness
Mix and match an interview with Samira Menta interfaith families celebrate the holidays in unique and meaningful ways.

Essay: Upstairs, downstairs church
by Sister Rhonda Miske, O.P.
During the holidays, community blossoms outside the sanctuary.

Essay: A great gift
by Jessie Bazan
Let your words be made flesh.
Mix and match
Interfaith families are shaping their holiday celebrations in new and meaningful ways.

Samira Mehta started studying contemporary interfaith families, she says, because of lunch with a friend. Her classmate, an Episcopal seminarian, had recently met a teenage boy preparing for both his bar mitzvah and confirmation, and her friend expressed frustration with the lack of resources available to interfaith families in similar situations.

Mehta, now an assistant professor of Jewish studies and women and gender studies at the University of Colorado Boulder, started researching "what happens when people have religious needs and desires that don't match what their institutional authorities want them to do." She became fascinated by how interfaith families reinterpret religious rituals. The result was her new book, Beyond Chrismukkah: The Christian-Jewish Interfaith Family in the United States (The University of North Carolina Press).

In her book, Mehta describes how interfaith couples in previous generations were often asked to choose one religion. A Catholic and a Jew, for example, had to raise their child as either Catholic or Jewish: There was no middle ground.

However, Mehta says, although this might have been the dominant teaching of both Christian and Jewish religious communities, in reality families were combining religious traditions and raising their children in a way that drew from both traditions to form a unique religious identity. Nowhere, Mehta says, is this negotiation more visible than during the December holidays.

How common are interfaith families in the United States?
That is a complicated question. Studies estimate, for example, that approximately 50 percent of American Jews marry people who are not Jewish. But this number varies, because it's hard to get sociologists to agree on who counts as a Jew.

In the book American Grace: How Religion Unites and Divides Us (Simon & Schuster), Robert Putnam and David Campbell estimate that one third of American marriages are interfaith. Few did its own study and found that 4 in 10 marriages in the past decade are interfaith. These numbers are changing dramatically: The number of interfaith marriages in the 1960s is significantly lower than interfaith marriages in 2010.

But these kinds of study define interfaith marriages in a very particular way: marriages between mainline Protestants, evangelical Protestants, Catholics, Muslims, Hindus, Buddhists, Jews, and sometimes religious "nones." So, for example, if someone who is a member of the Presbyterian Church (USA), which is a mainline Protestant denomination, marries someone who is a member of the Presbyterian Church of America, an evangelical denomination, that counts as an interfaith marriage. But if a Presbyterian Church (USA) member marries someone who belongs to the United Church of Christ, those are both mainline denominations and are not counted as interfaith.

These studies are also tailored for an American demographic that's more interested in nuances among Christian- and Jewish-based denominations. They count marriages between Protestants and Catholics as interfaith but not marriages between a Reform Jew and an Orthodox Jew—religious traditions with just as many, if not arguably more, differences. Not to mention the fact that Hindus and Islam are not monoliths but are treated as such in this context.

In addition, a marriage between someone who attends Mass daily and a lapsed Catholic won't show up as interfaith in these studies. But these marriages might well have just as many differences as one between a lapsed Catholic and a secular Jew.

Why write about interfaith families?
During graduate school I became interested in the question of what happens when people have religious needs and beliefs that don't match up with what the institutional authority says to do. When does the institution bend? When do people? When do they go along with what they're being told to do? When do they go rogue and make their own decisions in other ways?

A friend of mine who's an Episcopal seminarian told me about a kid who came to him for confirmation classes. His family had never attended church regularly, but they wanted their son to be confirmed. My friend agreed to meet with him one on one. At their first meeting, the kid asked, "Is this going to be as much work as preparing for my bar mitzvah?"

To his credit, he knew the rabbi who performed the bar mitzvah, so there were questions about what confirming this kid would do to the relationship between the church and the synagogue. Also, was he going to be confirmed? What did they think confirmation was? Why did they want to do both?

By the time they met again, the kid was fully engaged. And during their final meeting, he asked, "Is this going to be as much work as preparing for my bar mitzvah?"

Mehta, now an assistant professor of Jewish studies and women and gender studies at the University of Colorado Boulder, started researching "what happens when people have religious needs and desires that don't match what their institutional authorities want them to do." She became fascinated by how interfaith families reinterpret religious rituals. The result was her new book, Beyond Chrismukkah: The Christian-Jewish Interfaith Family in the United States (The University of North Carolina Press, 2018).

The editors' interview
Samira Mehta
Assistant professor of women and gender studies and Jewish studies, University of Colorado Boulder
Families can hold different theologies and rituals in tension.

When my friend tried to find resources to help, the only ones that existed were trying to talk people out of doing things like this. Nothing addressed what was going on for these families. When he told me about this, I got really interested in the work these families imagined religious rituals were doing for their family, child, and communities. It was really important for me to answer these questions in a way that didn’t presuppose the family was wrong. Every religious community—Jewish, Catholic, Protestant—believes their rituals and rites are important. But what does it mean if a family doesn’t think of confirmation, for example, as making a monogamous commitment to a particular religious tradition? This family might not think of rituals as meaning what the church says they mean, but that doesn’t make their thought inherently less valid.

Why are the December holidays such a sticking point for interfaith families?

Many interfaith families think of themselves as fairly secular: They don’t necessarily care about going to church or synagogue. But it turns out they often care a lot about the holiday traditions that happen in the home. Even if someone doesn’t believe that the only way to God is through Christ, they might still passionately want a Christmas tree. Or if they don’t have one, they discover that they get depressed around the holidays.

Similarly, for many people who grew up Jewish, December can feel like a time when the entire country sort of gets together to say, “You’re not actually a real American.” All of a sudden they are outsiders, as the entire country celebrates something they don’t participate in. Of course there are some Jews who love Christmas, who go to the mall and look at the lights and decorations and do their own fun and meaningful things on Christmas. But many people feel alienated. They want their home to feel like a sanctuary where they don’t have their noses rubbed in this holiday in which they don’t participate.

How do these tensions affect holiday practices?

ThirtySomething was a television show in the 1980s and early ’90s that portrayed an interfaith couple. In the show’s first season, a couple is getting ready to celebrate their first Christmas after having a baby. The husband says something about how he always loved celebrating Christmas with his wife, but then he looks at his daughter and says, “What does it mean that she grows up to love Christmas too? Does that mean she isn’t Jewish? Now I think about getting a tree and I see my grandfather rising up from his grave and having another heart attack.”

This scene depicts a real fear in Judaism. It’s such a small religion, and it’s always the minority. So if Jews celebrate other religions’ traditions, will that cause them to assimilate and die out?

As interfaith marriage began to rise in the 1980s, Reform Judaism reached a historically low point. Many Reform Jewish families didn’t speak much Hebrew or celebrate many of the Jewish holidays. What marked homes as Jewish wasn’t the presence of Jewish ritual but the absence of Christian ritual. It wasn’t having a Shabbat dinner or lighting Shabbat candles, but rather not celebrating Christmas.

At this point in history, if interfaith couples wanted a rabbi to perform their wedding, many would have to promise to have a Jewish home. This meant giving up Christmas. Rabbis would tell couples they couldn’t have a Christmas tree of their own. They could visit their families and celebrate Christmas outside the home, but they could not celebrate at home. The argument was that celebrating Christmas at home would confuse their children and disrupt their Jewish identities. Instead, parents were told to tell their kids that they were “helping our family celebrate their holiday.”

This is changing. Some rabbis will focus more on what a family is adding to form a Jewish home rather than on the Christian practices they are giving up. But some rabbis still insist on this today.

Did people obey the rabbis in this way?

People pushed against this idea from the very beginning. I came across a letter in the American Jewish Archives from a man writing to the head of one of the main Reform governing bodies. He’s married to a Christian woman and writes, “We had a Jewish wedding, and the rabbi made my wife promise that we wouldn’t have a Christmas tree in my house.” His wife’s family is in Europe, so they can’t go visit over the holidays, and he says that she gets very sad and depressed around Christmas because she can’t celebrate. He also points out that they live on an entirely Jewish street and everyone around them has a Christmas tree.

In fact, many American Jews in the late ’70s and early ’80s celebrated Christmas like a secular American holiday. They had presents, trees, and maybe Santa Claus. There were Jews who held secular Christmas parties that didn’t look at all different from those of many nonpracticing Christians.

We all know lots of Americans who don’t go to church or even think of themselves as Christian but still celebrate Christmas. They may not talk about Advent or the birth of the Christ child, but they have a tree, presents, stockings, a big dinner, and Santa Claus. They talk about peace on Earth, goodwill toward men, Charles Dickens, and all that. Some American Jews were doing the same thing.

What about Hanukkah? Can it replace Christmas for Jewish interfaith families?

Many American Jews celebrate Hanukkah as a children’s holiday. Adults don’t tend to exchange presents, but families will give kids one present each night for eight nights. Sometimes there’s a bigger present the first or last night. Some families do theme nights where they’ll give a book, for example, on a certain night. Everyone does something different. But overall Hanukkah isn’t an important holiday in the Jewish liturgical year. It’s more of a culturally important holiday to Jewish families with little kids.

But for interfaith families, Hanukkah can be a way of balancing out the holiday season. Sometimes if a family gives up Christmas, then they’ll ramp up Hanukkah to make the Christian member of the couple feel like something festive is happening in December.

Where does Chrismukkah come from?

Chrismukkah was invented by the television show The O.C. The One of the characters is half Jewish and half Christian, and he describes Chrismukkah as “eight days of presents followed by one day of many presents.” On the show, his family has a tree and lots of presents, and then they do a stereotypical Jewish Christmas: They get Chinese takeout and watch movies all afternoon.
The idea of Chrismukkah spread. Chrismukkah was one of TIME magazine's buzzwords of the year in 2004. There's a coffee table book about how to celebrate Hanukkah outside of The O.C.? Most people I talked to for my book didn't celebrate any kind of mash-up holidays relatively discrete. If they're lighting a menorah in the shadow of a Christmas tree, it's because they put the Christmas tree up the day after Thanksgiving.

Most people make latkes, spin the dreidel, have Hanukkah gelt, exchange whatever presents they give, and so on. And then on December 24 or 25 and January 6, depending on their tradition, they celebrate Christmas Eve, Christmas, and the Epiphany separately.

Do people actually celebrate Chrismukkah outside of The O.C.? Most people I talked to for my book didn't celebrate any kind of mash-up holiday. I don't want to say that there's no one in the entire world who celebrates Chrismukkah for real. I certainly don't want to say that no interfaith couple throws a crazy Chrismukkah-themed holiday party for their friends. People absolutely do that. But the holiday doesn't seem to represent what I found among the people I studied.

What most people do is celebrate Hanukkah first and then Christmas. Most of the time, the two holidays don't happen at the same time. Hanukkah is based on a lunar calendar, and it moves around. This means that even families who celebrate both tend to keep the holidays relatively discrete. If they're lighting a menorah in the shadow of a Christmas tree, it's because they put the Christmas tree up the day after Thanksgiving. Most people make latkes, spin the dreidel, have Hanukkah gelt, exchange whatever presents they give, and so on. And then on December 24 or 25 and January 6, depending on their tradition, they celebrate Christmas Eve, Christmas, and the Epiphany separately.

How do real-life interfaith families navigate the holidays? At the very end of my project I interviewed a Hindu-Catholic couple. They work really hard to make sure that their children have real access to both Mormon and Jewish worldviews, including the theological underpinnings of those traditions. Many times, people ask them if that's confusing to their kids. Their response is, "Life is confusing." Spiritual growth is often hard. The mother of this family is a Mormon and a feminist, and that's hard for her every day. There are some Catholic feminists who find being both Catholic and feminist challenging on a regular basis. But we don't say you can't be both. We have a lot of ideologies we hold in tension.

When her oldest daughter was preparing for her bar mitzvah, she had a meeting with the bishop in her Mormon ward who basically told her flat out that she couldn't be both Mormon and Jewish. She came home and cried. Then she decided to become Jewish, in part because the Jewish community wasn't forcing her to choose between these two parts of her identity.

I'd been waiting for something like that to happen in these interviews. A lot of the people I talked to are secular Jews, lapsed Catholics, or post-Protestants. They don't necessarily have deep theological commitments in the first place. Many of them end up as religious nones, some join really liberal religious spaces, and others end up being sort of "High Holiday Jews" or "Chreaster Catholics." Other times, people have stronger religious commitments but not strong dedications to truth claims. If you're an evangelical Christian and believe in the narrow of your bones that people who don't accept Jesus Christ as their personal savior are going to hell, then you probably won't fall in love with and marry a Jew.

One of the families I interviewed was a Jewish-Mormon couple. They work really hard to make sure that their children have real access to both Mormon and Jewish worldviews, including the theological underpinnings of those traditions. Many times, people ask them if that's confusing to their kids. Their response is, "Life is confusing." Spiritual growth is often hard. The mother of this family is a Mormon and a feminist, and that's hard for her every day. There are some Catholic feminists who find being both Catholic and feminist challenging on a regular basis. But we don't say you can't be both. We have a lot of ideologies we hold in tension.

When her oldest daughter was preparing for her bar mitzvah, she had a meeting with the bishop in her Mormon ward who basically told her flat out that she couldn't be both Mormon and Jewish. She came home and cried. Then she decided to become Jewish, in part because the Jewish community wasn't forcing her to choose between these two parts of her identity.