

## **Articles**

PRIORITY DISPUTES BETWEEN HOLDERS OF OLD ORDER MINERAL RIGHTS AND HOLDERS OF PROSPECTING RIGHTS OR MINING RIGHTS UNDER THE MPRDA IN SOUTH AFRICA: *AQUILA* HAS LANDED (CONTINUED)

REDUCING EMISSIONS THROUGH RENEWABLE ENERGY: EU AND U.S. ENERGY POLICY FRAMEWORKS IN THE AGE OF NATURAL GAS

THE BLM'S DUTY TO INCORPORATE CLIMATE SCIENCE INTO PERMITTING PRACTICES AND A PROPOSAL FOR IMPLEMENTING A NET-ZERO REQUIREMENT INTO OIL AND GAS PERMITTING

## **Notes & Comments**

CITIZEN SUITS FOR MOBILE SOURCES: ENFORCEMENT AGAINST INCIDENTS OF EMISSIONS CHEATING

REIMAGINING WHAT IS NECESSARY: USING ACTIVE MANAGEMENT IN WILDERNESS AREAS TO MITIGATE HIGH-LOSS WILDFIRES

MONUMENTS IN NAME ONLY: THE DELAY BETWEEN DESIGNATION AND PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MONUMENTS

---

# Colorado Natural Resources, Energy & Environmental Law Review

---

Volume 32, Number 2

Summer 2021

© 2021 by

Colorado Natural Resources, Energy & Environmental Law Review

Colorado Natural Resources,  
Energy & Environmental Law Review  
logo by Bill Foehring

ISSN: 2327-0683

## Subscriptions

	<u>Personal</u>	<u>Institutional</u>
Single Issue	\$20.00	\$25.00
Entire Volume	\$40.00	\$50.00

Payable in U.S. currency or equivalent only. Check should accompany order.  
Please add \$5 per single issue for postage and \$15 per volume for overseas postage.  
All correspondence regarding subscriptions should be addressed to:

Managing Editor  
Colorado Natural Resources, Energy & Environmental Law Review  
University of Colorado Law School  
Campus Box 401  
Boulder, CO 80309-0401 - USA

## Manuscripts

The *Environmental Law Review* invites submission of manuscripts to be considered for publication. Manuscripts may be mailed to the address below or e-mailed directly to [elr.articles@colorado.edu](mailto:elr.articles@colorado.edu). Unsolicited manuscripts can be returned if accompanied by postage and handling fees of \$3.00 for third class or \$5.00 for first class mail. Manuscripts can be sent to:

Lead Articles Editor  
Colorado Natural Resources, Energy & Environmental Law Review  
University of Colorado Law School  
Campus Box 401  
Boulder, CO 80309-0401 - USA

---

E-mail: [envtl.law.review@colorado.edu](mailto:envtl.law.review@colorado.edu)

Internet Site: <https://www.colorado.edu/law/research/journals/colorado-natural-resources-energy-environmental-law-review>



---

## Statement of Purpose and Editorial Policy

---

The *Colorado Natural Resources, Energy & Environmental Law Review* is a student edited academic legal journal dedicated to natural resources, energy, and environmental law and policy at local, regional, and global scales. The Journal was formerly known as the *Colorado Journal of International Environmental Law & Policy* and we continue to publish articles that fall within the scope of our former title.

The *Environmental Law Review* is interested in articles submitted by authors that fall within this stated purpose. Authors uncertain whether their article is suitable for publication are encouraged to contact the Editor-in-Chief to discuss the subject matter of their article.

Articles or other materials from authors may be accepted for publication prior to undergoing any editorial modifications. Such materials may also be conditionally accepted with the understanding that the author will undertake major modifications prior to publication. Where appropriate, papers may be reviewed by experts within the relevant field to aid the *Environmental Law Review's* publication decisions and editing processes. Editors will work with authors to refine the written product throughout the publication process, with the overall objective being to enhance the effectiveness of written communication.

Views expressed in the *Environmental Law Review* are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the *Environmental Law Review's* Editors or Staff.

---

Published twice annually by the  
Colorado Natural Resources, Energy & Environmental Law Review  
University of Colorado Law School  
320 Wolf Law Building, Campus Box 401, Boulder, CO 80309-0401,  
an association of students sponsored by  
UNIVERSITY OF COLORADO LAW SCHOOL STUDENT FUNDS

---

Cite as: 32 COLO. NAT. RES., ENERGY & ENVTL. L. REV. \_\_\_\_ (2021).



---

# Colorado Natural Resources, Energy & Environmental Law Review

---

Volume 32, Number 2

Summer 2021

## Board of Editors

*Editor-in-Chief*

LEAH VASARHELYI

*Managing Editor*

CODY PHILLIPS

*Executive Editor*

GABRIELLE FALCON

*Production Editors*

RYAN LOLAR

ANJIE ZHI

SIDNEY TIKALSKY

*Articles Editors*

MATTHEW NADEL

ERIN WOOLLEY

JOSEPH HOLVEY

WYATT FORMAN

*Sources Editor*

MCKENZIE BRANDON

*Notes and Comments Editors*

LIAM PATTON

PAIGE LAMBERT

PETER JAACKS

NAOMI KING

## Staff Writers

DANIELLA BARBERO

MONICA BUNNAY

DILLON CLAYTON

APRIL CRAIN

NICHOLAS CROCKETT

LAUREN DAVIS

SAVANNAH HOOK

MADELINE KOFOED

LUCAS O'BRIEN

MAYA RAPHAEL

JACK RAYCRAFT

JOHNSIE WILKINSON

PATRICK WITTERSCHEIN

## Faculty Advisor

MARK SQUILLACE



---

# The University of Colorado Law School

---

## Law School Faculty, 2020–2021

### *Deans*

- S. JAMES ANAYA, *Dean and Charles Inglis Thompson Professor of Law*. B.A., University of New Mexico; J.D., Harvard University.
- FREDERIC BLOOM, *Associate Dean for Faculty Affairs and Research*. B.A., Washington University in St. Louis; J.D., Stanford University.
- WHITING DIMOCK, *Senior Assistant Dean for Students*. B.A., Williams College; J.D., University of Colorado.
- MARCI FULTON, *Assistant Dean for Employer Relations and Outreach*. B.A., J.D., University of Colorado.
- AMY GRIFFIN, *Associate Dean for Instructional Development*. B.A., Boston College; J.D., University of California, Berkeley.
- FERNANDO R. GUZMAN, III, *Assistant Dean for Diversity, Equity & Inclusive Excellence*. B.A., Santa Clara University; M.S., California State University; Ph.D., University of Denver.
- PETER SANDERS, *Assistant Dean for Advancement*. B.A., Guilford College; M.S., St. Johns College; M.S., State University of New York at Buffalo.
- KRISTINE M. JACKSON, *Assistant Dean for Admissions & Financial Aid*. B.S., University of North Carolina; J.D., George Mason University.
- MARK LOEWENSTEIN, *Associate Dean for Curricular Affairs and Montfort Professor of Commercial Law*. A.B., J.D., University of Illinois, Champaign-Urbana.
- TODD ROGERS, *Assistant Dean for Career Development*. B.S., Trinity University; J.D., University of Texas.
- JENNIFER SULLIVAN, *Senior Assistant Dean for Administration and Program Development*. B.A., Case Western Reserve University; J.D., Duke University.

### *Emeritus Faculty*

- GEORGIA K. BRISCOE, B.A., Washington State University; A.M.L.S. University of Michigan; M.A. University of San Diego; M.A. University of San Diego.
- HAROLD H. BRUFF, *Nicholas Rosenbaum Professor of Law*. B.A., Williams College; J.D., Harvard University.
- EMILY M. CALHOUN, *Professor Emeritus*. B.A., M.A., Texas Tech University; J.D., University of Texas.
- JAMES N. CORBRIDGE, JR., *Professor Emeritus*. A.B., Brown University; LL.B., Yale University.
- TED J. FIFLIS, *Professor Emeritus*. B.S., Northwestern University; LL.B., Harvard University.
- H. PATRICK FURMAN, *Clinical Professor Emeritus*. B.A., J.D., University of Colorado.
- WAYNE GAZUR, *Professor Emeritus*. B.S., University of Wyoming; J.D., University of Colorado; LL.M., University of Denver.
- DAVID S. HILL, *Professor Emeritus*. B.S., J.D., University of Nebraska.
- J. DENNIS HYNES, *Professor Emeritus*. B.A., LL.B., University of Colorado.
- HOWARD C. KLEMME, *Professor Emeritus*. B.A., LL.B., University of Colorado; LL.M., Yale University.



ROBERT F. NAGEL, *Professor Emeritus*. B.A., Swarthmore College; J.D., Yale University.  
WILLIAM T. PIZZI, *Professor Emeritus*. A.B., Holy Cross College; J.D. Harvard University; M.A. University of Massachusetts.  
PETER N. SIMON, JR., *Associate Professor Emeritus*. B.S., M.D., University of Wisconsin; J.D., University of California, Berkeley.  
ARTHUR H. TRAVERS, JR., *Professor Emeritus*. B.A., Grinnell College; LL.B., Harvard University.  
MICHAEL J. WAGGONER, *Professor Emeritus*. A.B., Stanford University; LL.B. Harvard University.  
MARIANNE WESSON, *Professor of Law and Schaden Chair for Experiential learning*. A.B., Vassar College; J.D., University of Texas.  
CHARLES F. WILKINSON, *University's Distinguished Professor and Moses Lasky Professor of Law*. B.A., Denison University; LL.B., Stanford University.

### ***Tenured and Tenure-Track Faculty***

RABEA BENHALIM, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.A., University of Texas at Dallas; M.P.P., University of Michigan; J.D., University of Texas Law School; L.L.M., University of Wisconsin Law School.  
J. BRAD BERNTHAL, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.A., University of Kansas; J.D., University of Colorado.  
ALEXIA BRUNET MARKS, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.A., Colgate University; M.S., Purdue University; Ph.D., Purdue University; J.D., Northwestern University.  
PAUL F. CAMPOS, *Professor of Law*. A.B., M.A., J.D., University of Michigan.  
DEBORAH J. CANTRELL, *Professor of Law and Director of Clinical Programs*. B.A., Smith College; M.A., University of California, Los Angeles; J.D., University of Southern California.  
KRISTEN A. CARPENTER, *Council Tree Professor of Law and Director of the American Indian Law Program*. B.A., Dartmouth College; J.D., Harvard Law School.  
MING HSU CHEN, *Associate Professor of Law, Courtesy Appointment in Political Science, Ethnic Studies Faculty Affiliate, and Director, Immigration Law and Policy Program*. A.B., Harvard University; J.D., New York University; Ph.D., University of California, Berkeley.  
RICHARD B. COLLINS, *Professor of Law*. B.A., Yale College; LL.B., Harvard University.  
JUSTIN DESAUTELS-STEIN, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.A., University of North Carolina, Asheville; J.D., University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill; LL.M., Harvard University.  
KRISTELIA GARCIA, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.A., Columbia University; J.D., Yale University.  
ERIK GERDING, *Professor of Law and Wolf-Nichol Fellow*. A.B., Duke University; J.D., Harvard University.  
AYA GRUBER, *Professor of Law*. B.A., University of California at Berkeley; J.D., Harvard University.  
LAKSHMAN D. GURUSWAMY, *Nicholas Doman Professor of International Environmental Law*. LL.B., Sri Lanka; Ph.D., University of Durham, U.K.  
JENNIFER S. HENDRICKS, *Professor of Law and Co-Director of the Juvenile & Family Law Program*. B.A., Swarthmore College, J.D., Harvard University.  
PETER HUANG, *Professor of Law and DeMuth Chair*. A.B., Princeton University; S.M., Harvard University; J.D., Stanford University; Ph.D., Harvard University.  
SHARON JACOBS, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.M., Cleveland Institute of Music, M.M., Julliard/Columbia University Exchange Program; J.D. Harvard Law School.

MARGOT KAMINSKI, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.A., Harvard University; J.D., Yale Law School.

CRAIG KONNETH, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.A., Fordham University; M.Phil., University of Cambridge; J.D., Yale Law School.

SARAH A. KRAKOFF, *Moses Lasky Professor of Law*. B.A., Yale University; J.D., University of California, Berkeley.

BENJAMIN LEVIN, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.A., Yale University; J.D., Harvard Law School.

SUZETTE MALVEAUX, *Provost Professor of Civil Rights Law and Director of the Byron R. White Center for the Study of American Constitutional Law*. A.B., Harvard University; J.D., New York University.

SCOTT A. MOSS, *Schaden Chair in Experiential Learning and Professor of Law*. B.A., M.A., Stanford University; J.D., Harvard University.

CHRISTOPHER B. MUELLER, *Henry S. Lindsley Professor of Procedure & Advocacy*. A.B., Haverford College; J.D., University of California, Berkeley.

HELEN NORTON, *Professor of Law and Ira C. Rothgerber Chair in Constitutional Law*. B.A., Stanford University; J.D., University of California, Berkeley.

NADAV ORIAN PEER, *Associate Professor of Law*. S.J.D., Harvard Law School; L.L.B., Tel-Aviv University.

SCOTT R. PEPPET, *Professor of Law*. B.A., Cornell University; M.S., University of Colorado; J.D., Harvard University.

CAROLYN B. RAMSEY, *Professor of Law*. B.A., University of California, Irvine; M.A., J.D., Stanford University.

PIERRE J. SCHLAG, *University Distinguished Professor and Byron R. White Professor of Constitutional Law*. B.A., Yale University; J.D., University of California, Los Angeles.

ANDREW SCHWARTZ, *Professor of Law*. Sc.B., Brown University; J.D., Columbia University.

SCOTT SKINNER-THOMPSON, *Associate Professor of Law and Affiliate Faculty, LGBTQ Studies Program*. B.A., Whitman College; L.L.M., J.D., Duke Law School.

SLOAN SPECK, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.A., Rice University; M.A., University of Chicago; J.D., University of Chicago Law School; L.L.M., New York University School of Law.

MARK SQUILLACE, *Raphael J. Moses Professor of Law*. B.S., Michigan State University; J.D., University of Utah.

HARRY SURDEN, *Associate Professor of Law*. B.A., Cornell University; J.D., Stanford University.

PHILIP J. WEISER, *Hatfield Professor of Law & Telecommunications, Dean Emeritus, Executive Director of the Silicon Flatirons Center for Law*. B.A., Swarthmore College; J.D., New York University.

AHMED WHITE, *Nicholas Rosenbaum Professor of Law Chair*. B.A., Southern University and A&M College; J.D., Yale University.

### ***Clinical Faculty***

VIOLETA CHAPIN, *Associate Clinical Professor of Law*. B.A., Columbia College; J.D., New York University.

ANN ENGLAND, *Clinical Professor of Law*. B.A., University of Michigan; J.D., University of Denver.

CARLA FREDERICKS, *Associate Clinical Professor and Director of the American Indian Law Program*. B.A., University of Colorado; J.D., Columbia Law School.

JONATHAN SKINNER-THOMPSON, *Associate Clinical Professor of Law and Director of the Getches-Green Natural Resources and Environmental Law Clinic*. B.A., University of California, Berkeley; J.D., Duke University School of Law.

BLAKE REID, *Assistant Clinical Professor*. B.A., University of Colorado; J.D., University of Colorado; LL.M. Georgetown University Law Center.

COLENE ROBINSON, *Clinical Professor of Law and Co-Director of Juvenile & Family Law Center*. B.A., Valparaiso University; J.D., Loyola University School of Law, Chicago.

### ***Legal Writing and Appellate Advocacy Faculty***

AMY BAUER, *Legal Writing Professor*. B.A., Duke University; J.D., William & Mary School of Law.

TERESA BRUCE, *Legal Writing Professor*. B.S., Colorado State University; J.D., Cornell Law School.

MEGAN HALL, *Legal Writing Professor*. B.A., Colorado State University; J.D., University of Colorado Law School.

DEREK H. KIERNAN-JOHNSON, *Legal Writing Professor*. A.B., Princeton University; J.D., University of Michigan.

GABRIELLE M. STAFFORD, *Legal Writing Professor*. B.A., University of Pennsylvania; J.D., Boston University.

TODD M. STAFFORD, *Legal Writing Professor*. B.A., Southern Methodist University; J.D., Duke University.

### ***Law Library Faculty***

ROBERT LINZ, *Head of Public Services and Associate Director of the William A. Wise Law Library*. B.A., Wake Forest University; J.D., University of Florida; M.L.I.S., Florida State University.

SUSAN NEVELOW MART, *Professor and Director of the William A. Wise Law Library*. B.A., University of California, Santa Cruz; J.D., University of California, Berkeley; M.L.I.S., San Jose State University.

JOAN POLICASTRI, *Collection Services and Research Librarian*. B.A., University of Colorado, Denver; M.A., University of Colorado, Denver; M.A., University of Denver; Certificate, Denver Paralegal Institute.

KERRI-ANN ROWE, *Student Services and Outreach Librarian*. B.A., Yale University; J.D., University of Notre Dame; M.L.I.S., Syracuse University.

KAREN SELDEN, *Metadata Services Librarian*. B.S., Pennsylvania State University; M.L.S., Simmons College.

LAUREN SENEY, *Associate Director and Head of Technical Services*.

JILL STURGEON, *Instructional Services and Research Librarian*. B.A., Brigham Young University; M.A., Wright State University; J.D., University of Arizona Law School; M.L.S., University of Arizona.

JANE E. THOMPSON, *Associate Director of Faculty Services and Research*. B.A., University of Missouri; M.A., M.L.L., J.D., University of Denver.

---

# Colorado Natural Resources, Energy & Environmental Law Review

---

Volume 32, Number 2

Summer 2021

## Table of Contents

### Articles

PRIORITY DISPUTES BETWEEN HOLDERS OF OLD ORDER MINERAL RIGHTS AND HOLDERS OF PROSPECTING RIGHTS OR MINING RIGHTS UNDER THE MPRDA IN SOUTH AFRICA: <i>AQUILA</i> HAS LANDED (CONTINUED) PIETER J. BADENHORST .....	195
REDUCING EMISSIONS THROUGH RENEWABLE ENERGY: EU AND U.S. ENERGY POLICY FRAMEWORKS IN THE AGE OF NATURAL GAS PETER MATHER .....	221
THE BLM’S DUTY TO INCORPORATE CLIMATE SCIENCE INTO PERMITTING PRACTICES AND A PROPOSAL FOR IMPLEMENTING A NET-ZERO REQUIREMENT INTO OIL AND GAS PERMITTING JAMIE GIBBS PLEUNE, JOHN C. RUPLE, & NADA WOLFF CULVER .....	253

### Notes & Comments

CITIZEN SUITS FOR MOBILE SOURCES: ENFORCEMENT AGAINST INCIDENTS OF EMISSIONS CHEATING PAIGE LAMBERT .....	341
REIMAGINING WHAT IS NECESSARY: USING ACTIVE MANAGEMENT IN WILDERNESS AREAS TO MITIGATE HIGH-LOSS WILDFIRES LIAM PATTON .....	367
MONUMENTS IN NAME ONLY: THE DELAY BETWEEN DESIGNATION AND PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MONUMENTS CODY PHILLIPS .....	399

