Idea Organization and Idea Recall

S.R. Young and L.E. Bourne, Jr.

University of Colorado

Navy

- 1 Dr. Meryl S. Baker Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152
- 1 CDR Robert J. Biersner Naval Medical R&D Command National Naval Medical Center Bethesda, MD 20814
- 1 Liaison Scientist
 Office of Naval Research
 Branch Office, London
 Pox 39
 FPO New York, NY 09510
- 1 Dr. Richard Cantone
 Navy Research Laboratory
 Code 7510
 Washington, DC 20375
- 1 Dr. Stanley Collyer Office of Naval Technology 800 N. Quincy Street Arlington, VA 22217
- 1 CDR Mike Curran Office of Naval Research 800 N. Quincy St. Code 270 Arlington, VA 22217
- 1 Dr. Tom Duffy Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152
- 1 Dr. Carl E. Englund
 Naval Health Research Center
 Code 8060 Environmental Physiology Dept
 P.O. Box 85122
 San Diego, CA 92138
- 1 DR. PAT FEDERICO Code P13 NPRDC San Diego, CA 92152
- 1 Dr. John Ford Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152
- 1 Dr. Mike Gaynor Navy Research Laboratory Code 7510 Washington, DC 20375

Navy

- 1 Dr. Jim Hollan
 Code 304
 Navy Personnel R & D Center
 San Diego, CA 92152
- 1 Dr. Ed Hutchins Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152
- 1 Dr. Norman J. Kerr Chief of Naval Technical Training Naval Air Station Memphis (75) Millington, TN 38054
- 1 Dr. Peter Kincaid Training Analysis & Evaluation Group Dept. of the Navy Orlando, FL 32813
- 1 Dr. James Lester ONR Detachment 495 Summer Street Boston, MA 02210
- 1 Dr. Ray Main Code 14 Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152
- 1 Dr. William L. Maloy Principal Civilian Advisor for Education and Training Naval Training Command, Code OOA Pensacola, FL 32503
- 1 Dr William Montague NPRDC Code 13 San Diego, CA 92152
- 1 Library, Code P201L Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152
- 1 Technical Director Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152
- 6 Commanding Officer Naval Research Laboratory Code 2627 Washington, DC 20390

Navy

- 1 Office of Naval Research Code 433 800 N. Quincy SStreet Arlington, VA 22217
- 6 Personnel & Training Research Group Code 442PT Office of Naval Research Arlington, VA 22217
- 1 Office of the Chief of Naval Operations Research Development & Studies Branch OP 115 Washington, DC 20350
- 1 Dr. Worth Scanland CNET (N-5) NAS, Pensacola, FL 32508
- 1 Mr. Irving Schiff
 Dept. of the Navy
 Chief of Naval Operations
 OP 113
 Washington, DC 20350
- 1 Dr. Robert G. Smith
 Office of Chief of Naval Operations
 OP-987H
 Washington, DC 20350
- 1 Dr. Alfred F. Smode, Director Training Analysis & Evaluation Group Dept. of the Navy Orlando, FL 32813
- 1 Dr. Richard Sorensen Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152
- 1 Dr. Frederick Steinheiser
 CNO OP115
 Navy Annex
 Arlington, VA 20370
- 1 Roger Weissinger-Baylon Department of Administrative Sciences Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, CA 93940
- 1 Dr. Douglas Wetzel Code 12 Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152

Navy

1 Mr John H. Wolfe
Navy Personnel R&D Center
San Diego, CA 92152

Marine Corps

- 1 H. William Greenup Education Advisor (E031) Education Center, MCDEC Quantico, VA 22134
- 1 Special Assistant for Marine
 Corps Matters
 Code 100M
 Office of Naval Research
 800 N. Quincy St.
 Arlington, VA 22217
- 1 DR. A.L. SLAFKOSKY SCIENTIFIC ADVISOR (CODE RD-1) HQ, U.S. MARINE CORPS WASHINGTON, DC 20380

Army

- 1 Technical Director
 U. S. Army Research Institute for the
 Behavioral and Social Sciences
 5001 Eisenhower Avenue
 Alexandria, VA 22333
- 1 Mr. James Baker Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333
- 1 Dr. Beatrice J. Farr U. S. Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333
- 1 Dr. Milton S. Katz Training Technical Area U.S. Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333
- 1 Dr. Marshall Narva US Army Research Institute for the Behavioral & Social Sciences 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333
- 1 Dr. Harold F. O'Neil, Jr. Director, Training Research Lab Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333
- 1 Dr. Joseph Psotka Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333
- 1 Dr. Robert Sasmor
 U. S. Army Research Institute for the
 Behavioral and Social Sciences
 5001 Eisenhower Avenue
 Alexandria, VA 22333
- 1 Dr. Robert Wisher Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333

Air Force

- 1 AFHRL/LRS
 Attn: Susan Ewing
 WPAFB
 WPAFB, OH 45433
- 1 U.S. Air Force Office of Scientific Research Life Sciences Directorate, NL Bolling Air Force Base Washington, DC 20332
- 1 Air University Library AUL/LSE 76/443 Maxwell AFB, AL 36112
- 1 Dr. Earl A. Alluisi HQ, AFHRL (AFSC) Brooks AFB, TX 78235
- 1 Bryan Dallman AFHRL/LRT Lowry AFB, CO 80230
- 1 Dr. Genevieve Haddad Program Manager Life Sciences Directorate AFOSR Bolling AFB, DC 20332
- 1 Dr. T. M. Longridge
 AFHRL/OTGT
 Williams AFB, AZ 85224
- 1 Dr. Joseph Yasatuke
 AFHRL/OT
 Williams AFB, AZ 58224

Department of Defense

- 12 Defense Technical Information Center Cameron Station, Bldg 5 Alexandria, VA 22314 Attn: TC
- 1 Military Assistant for Training and Personnel Technology Office of the Under Secretary of Defens for Research & Engineering Room 3D129, The Pentagon Washington, DC 20301
- 1 Major Jack Thorpe DARPA 1400 Wilson Blvd. Arlington, VA 22209

Civilian Agencies

- 1 Dr. Patricia A. Butler
 NIE-BRN Bldg, Stop # 7
 1200 19th St., NW
 Washington, DC 20208
- 1 Dr. Paul G. Chapin Linguistics Program National Science Foundation Washington, DC 20550
- 1 Dr. Susan Chipman Learning and Development National Institute of Education 1200 19th Street NW Washington, DC 20208
- 1 Dr. John Mays National Institute of Education 1200 19th Street NW Washington, DC 20208
- 1 Dr. Arthur Melmed OERI 1200 19th Street NW Washington, DC 20208
- 1 Dr. Andrew R. Molnar Office of Scientific and Engineering Personnel and Education National Science Foundation Washington, DC 20550
- 1 Dr. Judith Orasanu National Institute of Education 1200 19th St., N.W. Washington, DC 20208
- 1 Dr. Ramsay W. Selden National Institute of Education 1200 19th St., NW Washington, DC 20208
- 1 Chief, Psychological Reserch Branch
 U. S. Coast Guard (G-P-1/2/TP42)
 Washington, DC 20593
- 1 Dr. Frank Withrow
 U. S. Office of Education
 400 Maryland Ave. SW
 Washington, DC 20202

Civilian Agencies

1 Dr. Joseph L. Young, Director Memory & Cognitive Processes National Science Foundation Washington, DC 20550

- 1 Dr. Erling B. Andersen
 Department of Statistics
 Studiestraede 6
 1455 Copenhagen
 DENMARK
- 1 Dr. John R. Anderson
 Department of Psychology
 Carnegie-Mellon University
 Pittsburgh, PA 15213
- 1 Dr. Nancy S. Anderson Department of Psychology University of Maryland College Park, MD 20742
- 1 Dr. Thomas H. Anderson Center for the Study of Reading 174 Children's Research Center 51 Gerty Drive Champiagn, IL 61820
- 1 Dr. John Annett
 Department of Psychology
 University of Warwick
 Coventry CV4 7AJ
 ENGLAND
- 1 Dr. Michael Atwood Bell Laboratories 11900 North Pecos St. Denver, CO 80234
- 1 Psychological Research Unit Dept. of Defense (Army Office) Campbell Park Offices Canberra ACT 2600 AUSTRALIA
- 1 Dr. Alan Baddeley Medical Research Council Applied Psychology Unit 15 Chaucer Road Cambridge CB2 2EF ENGLAND
- 1 Dr. Patricia Baggett
 Department of Psychology
 University of Colorado
 Boulder, CO 80309
- 1 Dr. Jonathan Baron 80 Glenn Avenue Berwyn, PA 19312

- 1 Dr. George R. Bieger B-110 Coleman Hall Bucknell University Lewisburg, PA 17837
- 1 Dr. John Black Yale University Box 11A, Yale Station New Haven, CT 06520
- 1 Dr. John S. Brown XEROX Palo Alto Research Center 3333 Coyote Road Palo Alto, CA 94304
- 1 Bundministerium der Verteidigung
 -Referat P II 4Psychological Service
 Postfach 1328
 D-5300 Bonn 1
 F. R. of Germany
- 1 Dr. C. Victor Bunderson WICAT Inc. University Plaza, Suite 10 1160 So. State St. Orem, UT 84057
- 1 Dr. Jaime Carbonell
 Carnegie-Mellon University
 Department of Psychology
 Pittsburgh, PA 15213
- 1 Dr. Pat Carpenter
 Department of Psychology
 Carnegie-Mellon University
 Pittsburgh, PA 15213
- 1 Dr. William Chase Department of Psychology Carnegie Mellon University Pittsburgh, PA 15213
- 1 Dr. Micheline Chi Learning R & D Center University of Pittsburgh 3939 O'Hara Street Pittsburgh, PA 15213
- 1 Dr. William Clancey Department of Computer Science Stanford University Stanford, CA 94306

- 1 Dr. Allan M. Collins Bolt Beranek & Newman, Inc. 50 Moulton Street Cambridge, MA 02138
- 1 Dr. Lynn A. Cooper LRDC University of Pittsburgh 3939 O'Hara Street Pittsburgh, PA 15213
- 1 Dr. Kenneth B. Cross
 Anacapa Sciences, Inc.
 P.O. Drawer Q
 Santa Barbara, CA 93102
- 1 LCOL J. C. Eggenberger
 DIRECTORATE OF PERSONNEL APPLIED RESEAR
 NATIONAL DEFENCE HQ
 101 COLONEL BY DRIVE
 OTTAWA, CANADA K1A
- 1 Dr. Jeffrey Elman
 University of California, San Diego
 Department of Linguistics
 La Jolla, CA 92093
- 1 ERIC Facility-Acquisitions 4833 Rugby Avenue Bethesda, MD 20014
- 1 Dr. Paul Feltovich
 Department of Medical Education
 Southern Illinois University
 School of Medicine
 P.O. Box 3926
 Springfield, IL 62708
- 1 Professor Reuven Feuerstein HWCRI Rehov Karmon 6 Bet Hakerem Jerusalem Israel
- 1 Mr. Wallace Feurzeig
 Department of Educational Technology
 Bolt Beranek & Newman
 10 Moulton St.
 Cambridge, MA 02238
- 1 Dr. Victor Fields Dept. of Psychology Montgomery College Rockville, MD 20850

- 1 Univ. Prof. Dr. Gerhard Fischer Liebiggasse 5/3 A 1010 Vienna AUSTRIA
- 1 Dr. Dexter Fletcher WICAT Research Institute 1875 S. State St. Orem, UT 22333
- 1 Dr. John R. Frederiksen Bolt Beranek & Newman 50 Moulton Street Cambridge, MA 02138
- 1 Dr. Alinda Friedman Department of Psychology University of Alberta Edmonton, Alberta CANADA T6G 2E9
- 1 Dr. Robert Glaser
 Learning Research & Development Center
 University of Pittsburgh
 3939 O'Hara Street
 PITTSBURGH, PA 15260
- 1 Dr. Marvin D. Glock 217 Stone Hall Cornell University Ithaca, NY 14853
- 1 Dr. Josph Goguen SRI International 333 Ravenswood Avenue Menlo Park, CA 94025
- 1 Dr. Daniel Gopher
 Department of Psychology
 University of Illinois
 Champaign, IL 61820
- 1 DR. JAMES G. GREENO LRDC UNIVERSITY OF PITTSBURGH 3939 O'HARA STREET PITTSBURGH, PA 15213
- 1 Dr. Barbara Hayes-Roth
 Department of Computer Science
 Stanford University
 Stanford, CA 95305

- 1 Dr. Kristina Hooper Clark Kerr Hall University of California Santa Cruz, CA 95060
- 1 Glenda Greenwald, Ed.
 Human Intelligence Newsletter
 P. O. Box 1163
 Birmingham, MI 48012
- 1 Dr. Earl Hunt Dept. of Psychology University of Washington Seattle, WA 98105
- 1 Dr. Steven W. Keele Dept. of Psychology University of Oregon Eugene, OR 97403
- 1 Dr. Scott Kelso Haskins Laboratories, Inc 270 Crown Street New Haven, CT 06510
- 1 Dr. David Kieras
 Department of Psychology
 University of Arizona
 Tuscon, AZ 85721
- 1 Dr. Walter Kintsch
 Department of Psychology
 University of Colorado
 Boulder, CO 80302
- 1 Dr. Stephen Kosslyn Department of Psychology Brandeis University Waltham, MA 02254
- 1 Dr. Pat Langley Carnegie-Mellon University Pittsburgh, PA 15213
- 1 Dr. Marcy Lansman
 The L. L. Thurstone Psychometric
 Laboratory
 University of North Carolina
 Davie Hall 013A
 Chapel Hill, NC 27514

- 1 Dr. Jill Larkin Department of Psychology Carnegie Mellon University Pittsburgh, PA 15213
- 1 Dr. Alan Lesgold Learning R&D Center University of Pittsburgh 3939 O'Hara Street Pittsburgh, PA 15260
- 1 Dr. Jim Levin
 University of California
 at San Diego
 Laboratory fof Comparative
 Human Cognition D003A
 La Jolla, CA 92093
- 1 Dr. Michael Levine
 Department of Educational Psychology
 210 Education Bldg.
 University of Illinois
 Champaign, IL 61801
- 1 Dr. Robert Linn College of Education University of Illinois Urbana, IL 61801
- 1 Dr. Jay McClelland
 Department of Psychology
 MIT
 Cambridge, MA 02139
- 1 Dr. James R. Miller Texas Instruments, Inc. Central Research Laboratory P. O. Box 226015, MS238 Dallas, TX 75266
- 1 Dr. Mark Miller Computer Thought Corporation 1721 West Plane Parkway Plano, TX 75075
- 1 Dr. Tom Moran
 Xerox PARC
 3333 Coyote Hill Road
 Palo Alto, CA 94304
- 1 Dr. Allen Munro Behavioral Technology Laboratories 1845 Elena Ave., Fourth Floor Redondo Beach, CA 90277

- 1 Dr. Donald A Norman
 Cognitive Science, C-015
 Univ. of California, San Diego
 La Jolla, CA 92093
- 1 Dr. Jesse Orlansky Institute for Defense Analyses 1801 N. Beauregard St. Alexandria, VA 22311
- 1 Dr. James W. Pellegrino University of California, Santa Barbara Dept. of Psychology Santa Barabara, CA 93106
- 1 Dr. Nancy Pennington University of Chicago 5801 S. Ellis Avenue Chicago, IL 60637
- 1 Mr. L. Petrullo 2431 N. Edgewood Street ARLINGTON, VA 22207
- 1 DR. PETER POLSON
 DEPT. OF PSYCHOLOGY
 UNIVERSITY OF COLORADO
 BOULDER, CO 80309
- 1 Dr. Fred Reif
 Physics Department
 University of California
 Berkeley, CA 94720
- 1 Dr. Lauren Resnick
 LRDC
 University of Pittsburgh
 3939 O'Hara Street
 Pittsburgh, PA 1521
- 1 Mary S. Riley
 Program in Cognitive Science
 Center for Human Information Processing
 University of California, San Diego
 La Jolla, CA 92093
- 1 Dr. Andrew M. Rose American Institutes for Research 1055 Thomas Jefferson St. NW Washington, DC 20007

- 1 Dr. Ernst Z. Rothkopf
 Bell Laboratories
 Murray Hill, NJ 07974
- 1 Dr. William B. Rouse Georgia Institute of Technology School of Industrial & Systems Engineering Atlanta, GA 30332
- 1 Dr. David Rumelhart Center for Human Information Processing Univ. of California, San Diego La Jolla, CA 92093
- 1 Dr. Michael J. Samet Perceptronics, Inc 6271 Variel Avenue Woodland Hills, CA 91364
- 1 Dr. Arthur Samuel Yale University Department of Psychology Box 11A, Yale Station New Haven, CT 06520
- 1 Dr. Roger Schank
 Yale University
 Department of Computer Science
 P.O. Box 2158
 New Haven, CT 06520
- 1 Dr. Walter Schneider Psychology Department 603 E. Daniel Champaign, IL 61820
- 1 Dr. Alan Schoenfeld Mathematics and Education The University of Rochester Rochester, NY 14627
- 1 DR. ROBERT J. SEIDEL
 INSTRUCTIONAL TECHNOLOGY GROUP
 HUMRRO
 300 N. WASHINGTON ST.
 ALEXANDRIA, VA 22314
- 1 Mr. Colin Sheppard
 Applied Psychology Unit
 Admiralty Marine Technology Est.
 Teddington, Middlesex
 United Kingdom

- 1 Dr. H. Wallace Sinaiko
 Program Director
 Manpower Research and Advisory Services
 Smithsonian Institution
 801 North Pitt Street
 Alexandria, VA 22314
- 1 Dr. Edward E. Smith Bolt Beranek & Newman, Inc. 50 Moulton Street Cambridge, MA 02138
- 1 Dr. Richard Snow School of Education Stanford University Stanford, CA 94305
- 1 Dr. Eliott Soloway
 Yale University
 Department of Computer Science
 P.O. Box 2158
 New Haven, CT 06520
- 1 Dr. Kathryn T. Spoehr Psychology Department Brown University Providence, RI 02912
- 1 Dr. Robert Sternberg Dept. of Psychology Yale University Box 11A, Yale Station New Haven, CT 06520
- 1 Dr. Albert Stevens
 Bolt Beranek & Newman, Inc.
 10 Moulton St.
 Cambridge, MA 02238
- 1 David E. Stone, Ph.D. Hazeltine Corporation 7680 Old Springhouse Road McLean, VA 22102
- 1 DR. PATRICK SUPPES
 INSTITUTE FOR MATHEMATICAL STUDIES IN
 THE SOCIAL SCIENCES
 STANFORD UNIVERSITY
 STANFORD, CA 94305
- 1 Dr. Kikumi Tatsuoka Computer Based Education Research Lab 252 Engineering Research Laboratory Urbana, IL 61801

- 1 Dr. Perry W. Thorndyke
 Perceptronics, Inc.
 545 Middlefield Road, Suite 140
 Menlo Park, CA 94025
- 1 Dr. Douglas Towne Univ. of So. California Behavioral Technology Labs 1845 S. Elena Ave. Redondo Beach, CA 90277
- 1 Dr. Benton J. Underwood Dept. of Psychology Northwestern University Evanston, IL 60201
- 1 Dr. Kurt Van Lehn Zerox PARC 3333 Coyote Hill Road Palo Alto, CA 94304
- 1 Dr. Keith T. Wescourt
 Perceptronics, Inc.
 545 Middlefield Road, Suite 140
 Menlo Park, CA 94025
- 1 DR. SUSAN E. WHITELY PSYCHOLOGY DEPARTMENT UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS Lawrence, KS 66045
- 1 William B. Whitten Bell Laboratories 2D-610 Holmdel, NJ 07733
- 1 Dr. Christopher Wickens Department of Psychology University of Illinois Champaign, IL 61820
- 1 Dr. Mike Williams Zerox PARC 3333 Coyote Hill Road Palo Alto, CA 94304



DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY

OFFICE OF NAVAL RESEARCH ARLINGTON, VIRGINIA 22217

15 Dec 1982

Dr. Lyle E. Bourne, Jr.
Institute of Cognitive Science
University of Colorado
Muenzinger Building, Campus Box 345
Boulder, Colorado 80309

Dear Lyle:

The title and abstract of your technical report "Idea Organization and Idea Recall" have been reviewed.

I am enclosing an updated distribution list for the report, together with two DTIC Form 50 cards. You should refer to the enclosed Research Reporting Requirements and Procedures package for detailed guidance regarding preparation and distribution. Please read this document carefully before you issue any report. Your attention is called particularly to the requirement involving the DTIC Accession Notice. Special plans on your part to comply with this requirement would be particularly appreciated.

Please note that, with respect to the enclosed distribution list, the number immediately preceding each name indicates how many copies should be sent to that addressee.

Sincerely,

Dorothy F. Gabor
Secretary for
MARSHALL J. FARR
Leader,
Personnel and Training
Research Group

Enclosures:

- (1) Distribution List
- (2) DTIC Form 50 Cards
- (3) Research Reporting Requirements and Procedures Package

REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE		READ INSTRUCTIONS BEFORE COMPLETING FORM	
1. REPORT NUMBER	2 GOVT ACCESSION NO.	3. RECIPIENT'S CATALOG NUMBER	
ONR-119		•	
4. TITLE (and Subtitle)		5. TYPE OF REPORT & PERIOD COVERED	
Idea Organization & Idea Recall		Technical Report	
·	·	6. PERFORMING ORG. REPORT NUMBER	
7. AUTHOR(s)		8. CONTRACT OR GRANT NUMBER(*)	
S.R. Young, Lyle E. Bourne, Jr.		N00014-78-C-0433	
9. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME AND ADDRESS Institute of Cognitive Science		10. PROGRAM ELEMENT, PROJECT, TASK AREA & WORK UNIT NUMBERS	
University of Colorado Boulder, CO		NR-157-422	
11. CONTROLLING OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS		12. REPORT DATE	
†		December, 1982	
Personnel and Training Research Programs		13. NUMBER OF PAGES	
Office of Naval Research (Code 458)		10	
14. MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS(II different	from Controlling Office)	15. SECURITY CLASS. (of this report)	
		Unclassified	
		15a, DECLASSIFICATION/DOWNGRADING SCHEDULE	
16. DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of this Report)			
Approved for public release; distribution limited			
17. DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different from Report)			
17. DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the Mostract entered in Block 20, it different dom Reports			
•	•		
18. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES			
18. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES			
19. KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number)			
recall, memory, writing			
recarr, memory, writing			
	•		
20. ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary end identify by block number)			
The effects of organizing ideas to produce a written text are investigated			
and discussed in terms of models of long term memory (Raijmakers & Shiffrin)			
and of composition (Flower & Hayes). Subjects generated ideas relevant to a			
specific topic on Day 1. Then they organized their ideas and wrote a coherent			
text on the topic. Twenty four hours later, subjects tended to free recall			
groups of ideas that had been clustered together during the text organization			
phase of the experiment, consistent with the time locking cluster of Raijmakers			
and Shiffrin.			

Abstract

The effects of organizing ideas to produce a written text are investigated and discussed in terms of models of long term memory (Raijmakers & Shiffrin) and of composition (Flower & Hayes). Subjects generated ideas relevant to a specific topic on Day 1. Then they organized their ideas and wrote a coherent text on the topic. Twenty four hours later, subjects tended to free recall groups of ideas that had been clustered together during the text organization phase of the experiment, consistent with the time locking cluster hypotheses of Raijmakers and Shiffrin.

Idea Organization and Idea Recall

Writing draws upon many of the same psychological processes involved in reading and text comprehension (Kintsch & van Dijk, 1978). Notably, both reading and writing involve the use of knowledge stored in long term memory. The writer draws ideas relevant to his/her topic from long term memory. Similarly, the reader draws upon relevant knowledge to construct a frame suitable for comprehending text. In the study that follows, we investigate changes in the organization of ideas in long term memory as a result their retrieval and use in various writing-related activities.

One of the most widely accepted and empirically well-documented models of long term memory was developed by Raijmakers and Shiffrin (1981). In their model, long term memory is conceived as a propositional network of ideas. It is organized in the sense that certain propositional nodes are related to one another, i.e., stored in proximity to one another. Within a knowledge cluster, there may exist many subclusters. This general structure of knowledge clusters and related subclusters is revealed when subjects freely generate ideas. It is our intent to investigate how the relationships among items within a subcluster and between subclusters change, after generation as a result of the organizational processes involved in writing.

Flower and Hayes (1979) have developed an analysis of writing that sets forth certain expectations about how the writing task should affect permanent memory structures. In their model, the writing process is conceived as three major subprocesses with distinct psychological characterisitics. The subprocesses are planning, translating, and editing. The planning process is subdivided into three components: generating and organizing ideas, and goal setting (the latter is a control process that

decides when to schedule generating, organizing, translating, or reviewing). The generating process is initiated by retrieval cues. In writing, the first memory probe is provided by information about the topic and the intended audience. As items are retrieved, associative chains are formed. Associative links are broken whenever something not useful to the writing task is retrieved. Generally, the ideas retrieved from long term memory are fragmentary and disconnected. The subprocess of organizing thus becomes important in determining the final written product.

Organizing involves hierarchically arranging goals or particular aspects of the topic to be discussed. These goals have subgoals or subtopics and supporting arguments. Flower and Hayes describe five elementary operators that work to organize the writer's goals -- identify first or last topic; order with respect to previous topic; find subordinate topic; find superordinate topic; and identify category. These operators are believed to be primarily responsible for transforming the generated ideas into written text.

While other processes are also involved in constructing a written text, we concentrate here on the subprocesses of generating and organizing. Our rationale is based on Flower and Hayes' predictions that the associative connections revealed in the generating stage will appear in the same sequence later unless an organizing process intervenes. Thus, we attempt to test whether the organizing subprocess affects items stored in permanent knowledge structures by assessing whether a later recall task is influenced by an intervening organizational task.

We conducted two pilot studies to determine whether recall order was more closely correlated with generation order or order of subsequent organization. In Study 1, subjects generated 12 ideas on a given topic and rank ordered them for importance to an article that they might write about

that topic. Twenty-four hours later they free recalled as many ideas as possible. Then subects ordered their ideas to form a coherent text outline three times independently. The results of Spearman rank order correlations revealed that recall order was uncorrelated with <u>both</u> generation and organization orders.

Study 2 was similar to Study 1 except that subjects generated ideas, rank ordered them and performed a free recall task during the same session. Again, order was unrelated to recall order although free recall order was negatively correlated with generation order.

As a result of these pilot findings, we decided to evaluate possible changes in long term memory in a different way. As the order of ideas recalled seemed unrelated to organization order, we investigated whether units of main and supporting ideas produced during organization cohered during recall, as might be suggested by the cluster/subcluster hypothesis of Raijmakers and Shiffrin.

Method

Subjects

Eighteen undergraduate students from the University of Colorado served as subjects for this experiment, thus fulfilling course requirements. Two experimental groups were formed by randomly assigning nine subjects to a group.

Procedure

On Day 1 (Generation), all subjects generated 20 ideas on how college differs from high school. Each idea was written on a numbered index card to reflect the generation order. Subjects in Group 1 (Organization) then

arranged their ideas in sequence using two orders, main ideas and supporting ideas. They were instructed to develop a coherent outline of a text, using only the ideas generated on the preceding day. This outline was then written on a sheet of paper. Subjects in Group 2 (Writing) were asked to write a text using the ideas they generated. The index cards were then used to identify the idea numbers corresponding to the texts of Group 2.

Subjects returned for a third session 24 hours later and were instructed to number their papers from 1-20 and recall their original ideas.

Results

As we were interested in the effects of organization on memory, our first analysis correlated generation and organization or writing (Day 1) orders with the order of ideas produced in recall (Day 2). Spearman rank order statistics were obtained for each subject and averaged across subjects in each group. The results of our pilot studies were replicated. There were no statistically significant effects for either group of subjects r=.136 and r=.145 for Groups 1 and 2 respectively. Recall order appears to be unrelated to both generation and organization order.

We then looked at recall probabilities for major topics and supporting arguments as identified either in outlines (Group 1) or written products (Group 2). Major ideas (93.5%) were recalled significantly more frequently than supporting ideas (77.6%) for both groups of subjects, F(1,16) = 10.47, p < 01. In addition, a significant group effect was obtained, F(1,16) = 10.21, p < 01. Subjects who wrote texts recalled more ideas in all (90.5%) than subjects who merely ordered their ideas (80.7%). This group

than subjects who merely ordered their ideas (80.7%). This group difference is reflected in both the percentage of main ideas and supporting arguments recalled, as depicted in Table 1.

Insert Table 1 about here

Further analyses were conducted to determine whether units produced in the organization stage were preserved during recall. Units consisted of a main idea and its supporting ideas. The average unit consisted of 4.5 ideas (one main idea and 3.5 supports) and did not vary between groups. Thus, we examined whether the ideas composing a unit created during the organization stage were recalled together during the recall stage. Overall, only 80% of the ideas used during the organization phase of the experiment were recalled. To determine whether these ideas were clustered as they were during organization, we calculated the percentage of ideas recalled together in each unit produced during organization. These percentages were then averaged for each group. Groups did not significantly differ in the percent of ideas cohering to the organization grouping (Group 1 = 55.4%, Group 2 = 58.0%). Of the ideas recalled, 57.7%preserved their organization unit grouping 24 hr. later. Many of the larger units (\overline{x} size = 7.2 ideas) were recalled in two separate clusters. However, only the cluster containing the originally identified main idea was used in calculating the above percent of unit coherence.

Discussion

Raijmakers and Shiffrin (1980) account for the free recall of items from long term memory in terms of retrieval strategies that provide a

certain structure for the items produced. Retrieval is presumed to operate on long term memory on a one unit or cluster at a time basis. Which unit is retrieved via a particular strategy may vary, however, from moment to moment even when the same retrieval cue is utilized. In the present experiment, initial generation reveals the inter-item or cluster relationships in long term memory as it is structured in subjects at the outset of this experiment.

As a subject creates a coherent text, certain items retrieved from long term memory are input into short term memory where they are rehearsed and recoded. According to Raijmakers and Shiffrin, items recoded together in short term memory are then re-input as units to long term memory. These units created in short term memory do not replace the initial structure. Rather, they enter long term memory as another copy of the same information. Which copy is most accessible at any given point in time is indeterminate in the Raijmakers and Shiffrin model except when subsequent retrieval is closely time-locked to unitization in short term memory.

Results of the present experiment are consistent with the Raijmakers and Shiffrin model in the sense that free recall subsequent to unitizing items in short term memory is as much or more consistent with how the items were reorganized than it is with intitial free recall or generation. The results further reflect positively on the suggestion of Flower and Hayes (1979) that the organization subprocess of writing results in marked changes in associative connections in long term memory. The final recall of items corresponded more with item organization produced during writing than with initial free recall. That is to say, subjects tended to recall items in the units created while organizing ideas to form a written text.

The time locking hypothesis of Raijmakers and Shiffrin is an important consideration that might distinguish their model from expectations based on

the postulates of Flower and Hayes. That is, as time is allowed to pass between the writing exercise and subsequent regeneration or free recall of items related to a particular topic, the correlation between initial and final free recall should increase. Final free recall should correlate better with the organization during writing if that free recall is taken close in time to the writing exercise. Correlation should decrease with the writing organziation and increase with the initial free recall structure as time passes, according to Raijmakers and Shiffrin. As the theory of Flower and Hayes is presently written, no similar expectation can be stated.

References

- Flower, L.S. & Hayes, J.R. A process model of composition. Technical Report No. 1, 1979, Document Design Project.
- Kintsch, W. & van Dijk, T.A. Toward a model of text comprehension and production. Psychological Review, 1978, 85, 363-394.
- Raijmakers, J.G.W. & Shiffrin, R.M. Search of associative memory.

 Psychological Review, 1981, 88, 93-134.

Table 1
Group Differences in Recall

of Main and Supporting Ideas

Ideas

	Major	Supporting
Group 1	89.5	71.5
Group 2	97.8	83.8

UNIVERSITY OF COLORADO, BOULDER

Institute of Cognitive Science



December 6, 1982

Dr. Marshall Farr Personnel & Training Research Program Office of Naval Research 800 North Quincy Avenue Arlington, VA 22217

Dear Dr. Farr:

Enclosed is the abstract for a manuscript prepared under ONR Contract NO0014-78-C-0433. It is entitled "Idea Organization and Idea Recall", by Sheryl R. Young and Lyle E. Bourne, Jr. We would like permission to make it a technical report. Please an updated listing.

Thank you,

Lyle E Bourne, Jr.

Director

Institute of Cognitive Science

LEB/dec enclosure