Cooperation without Trust?
Bosnia and the North Caucasus

Michael D. Ward
John O’Loughlin
Kristin Bakke & Xun Cao

August 30, 2006

---

1This research was supported by the U.S. National Science Foundation (grant number 0433927), via its Cross Directorate Initiative in Human and Social Dynamics. APSA 2006 Presentation.
Cooperation without Trust? Bosnia and the North Caucasus

Outline

Introduction
Thanks.

Project Overview

Surveys
Geography
Typical Respondent
Age Distribution
Nationalities
Direction of Ethnic Relations?
Desire More Ethnically Diverse Friends?
Vignettes

Empirical Results
What have we learned?

The Road Ahead
Contributors & Sponsors

1. Our biggest thanks are to the respondents in BiH and the North Caucasus region who graciously answered our questions.
Cooperation without Trust? Bosnia and the North Caucasus

Introduction

Thanks.

Contributors & Sponsors

1. Our biggest thanks are to the respondents in BiH and the North Caucasus region who graciously answered our questions.  
2. This research was supported by the U.S. National Science Foundation (grant number 0433927), via its Cross Directorate Initiative in Human and Social Dynamics. We have been aided by the support and encouragement of our program officers at NSF, including Tom Baerwald, Rachelle Hollander, Pat White, and Frank Scioli.  
3. Marina Francic and Dino Djipa of Prism Research in Sarajevo, as well as Alexei Grazhdankin of the Levada Center in Moscow  
4. Vladimir Kolossov, Gerard Toal, Frank Witmer, & Kyle Joyce  
5. Gary King & Jonathan Wand
Project Overview

Multi Scale, Multi Disciplinary, Multi Hard

Our Project explores civil war outcomes in Bosnia and in the North Caucasus area of Russia. Both regions experienced violent civil war in the 1990s consequent on the break-up of Yugoslavia and the Soviet Union.

1. What is the character and localized distribution of economic, political, social, environmental, and health outcomes of wars in the conflict zones?

2. What explains these distributions?

3. What insights are gained by combining different methods and scales? How to compare?

4. Are postwar developments in former conflict zones enhancing or reducing long term prospects for peace?
Unforgettable BiH
Remembering
Rebuilding
Unforgettable BiH

Remembering  
Rebuilding
Views of Dagestan
Views of Dagestan
Main Question

on possibilities for cooperation

Among national groups, it is possible to create cooperation (even if you can never fully trust)?

1. Strongly Disagree
2. Mostly Disagree
3. Neither
4. Mostly Agree
5. Strongly Agree
Beliefs in Inter-ethnic Cooperation
BiH & North Caucasus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cooperation Possible, but Never Fully Trust?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mostly Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mostly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Bosnia
- Russia

Michael D. Ward John O’Loughlin Kristin Bakke & Xun Cao
Beliefs in Inter-ethnic Cooperation

BiH
Beliefs in Inter-ethnic Cooperation
North Caucasus

Interethnic Cooperation Median Response by Survey Sampling Point, Dec 2005

Median Cooperation Value

Number of Surveys

Majority Russian Rayoni & Cities
Typical Respondent on possibilities for cooperation

1. Our typical respondent is a middle-aged (44 year old) woman. Interestingly, of all of our 4000 respondents, 2242 are women and 1758 are men.

2. The typical respondent has finished secondary or technical high school and assesses her family’s material status on a scale from *we can purchase all we want*, *we have money for food and clothes only*, *we have money for food only*, to *we have no money for food*, responded that the family has *money for food only*. 
Age Pyramid

Age Distribution

Density

Bosnia

North Caucasus

Age

Density

20

30

40

50

60

70

80

0.02 0.01 0 0.01 0.02
Direction of Ethnic Relations?

Direction of National Relations over Last 5 Years?

- Worse
- The Same
- Better

Bosnia Russia
Do you want a more diverse friendship network?

Desire Friends of Different Nationality?

- Strongly Disagree
- Mostly Disagree
- Neither
- Mostly Agree
- Strongly Agree

Bosnia | Russia
Olga Vignette

- Extreme Problems
- Severe Problems
- Moderate Problems
- Mild Problems
- No Problems

Bosnia vs. Russia
## Empirical Results

**Ordered Probit**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>$\sigma$</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>$\sigma$</th>
<th>t-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia</td>
<td>-0.534</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>-9.407</td>
<td>0.648</td>
<td>0.089</td>
<td>7.313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>0.008</td>
<td>0.039</td>
<td>0.210</td>
<td>0.144</td>
<td>0.060</td>
<td>2.377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.181</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>3.316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>0.009</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>0.465</td>
<td>0.033</td>
<td>0.029</td>
<td>1.140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material status</td>
<td>-0.035</td>
<td>0.027</td>
<td>-1.275</td>
<td>-0.129</td>
<td>0.042</td>
<td>-3.055</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic relations</td>
<td>-0.059</td>
<td>0.035</td>
<td>-1.661</td>
<td>0.069</td>
<td>0.055</td>
<td>1.267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current situation</td>
<td>-0.025</td>
<td>0.037</td>
<td>-0.674</td>
<td>0.155</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>2.727</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic friends</td>
<td>0.072</td>
<td>0.021</td>
<td>3.485</td>
<td>-0.032</td>
<td>0.032</td>
<td>-0.991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closest friends</td>
<td>0.088</td>
<td>0.027</td>
<td>3.307</td>
<td>0.045</td>
<td>0.041</td>
<td>1.102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pride</td>
<td>0.091</td>
<td>0.021</td>
<td>4.330</td>
<td>0.025</td>
<td>0.033</td>
<td>0.780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member of Ethnic Organization</td>
<td>-0.029</td>
<td>0.097</td>
<td>-0.303</td>
<td>0.085</td>
<td>0.149</td>
<td>0.572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violence</td>
<td>0.176</td>
<td>0.045</td>
<td>3.876</td>
<td>0.095</td>
<td>0.070</td>
<td>1.354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian</td>
<td>-0.558</td>
<td>0.059</td>
<td>-9.500</td>
<td>-0.559</td>
<td>0.092</td>
<td>-6.087</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ossetin</td>
<td>0.924</td>
<td>0.129</td>
<td>7.168</td>
<td>2.198</td>
<td>0.224</td>
<td>9.799</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croat</td>
<td>-0.214</td>
<td>0.074</td>
<td>-2.879</td>
<td>-0.827</td>
<td>0.115</td>
<td>-7.165</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chopit**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>$\sigma$</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>$\sigma$</th>
<th>t-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia</td>
<td>-0.559</td>
<td>0.092</td>
<td>-6.087</td>
<td>-0.559</td>
<td>0.092</td>
<td>-6.087</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>-0.558</td>
<td>0.059</td>
<td>-9.500</td>
<td>-0.559</td>
<td>0.092</td>
<td>-6.087</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>0.924</td>
<td>0.129</td>
<td>7.168</td>
<td>2.198</td>
<td>0.224</td>
<td>9.799</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>0.009</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>0.465</td>
<td>0.033</td>
<td>0.029</td>
<td>1.140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material status</td>
<td>-0.035</td>
<td>0.027</td>
<td>-1.275</td>
<td>-0.129</td>
<td>0.042</td>
<td>-3.055</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic relations</td>
<td>-0.059</td>
<td>0.035</td>
<td>-1.661</td>
<td>0.069</td>
<td>0.055</td>
<td>1.267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current situation</td>
<td>-0.025</td>
<td>0.037</td>
<td>-0.674</td>
<td>0.155</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>2.727</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic friends</td>
<td>0.072</td>
<td>0.021</td>
<td>3.485</td>
<td>-0.032</td>
<td>0.032</td>
<td>-0.991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closest friends</td>
<td>0.088</td>
<td>0.027</td>
<td>3.307</td>
<td>0.045</td>
<td>0.041</td>
<td>1.102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pride</td>
<td>0.091</td>
<td>0.021</td>
<td>4.330</td>
<td>0.025</td>
<td>0.033</td>
<td>0.780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member of Ethnic Organization</td>
<td>-0.029</td>
<td>0.097</td>
<td>-0.303</td>
<td>0.085</td>
<td>0.149</td>
<td>0.572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violence</td>
<td>0.176</td>
<td>0.045</td>
<td>3.876</td>
<td>0.095</td>
<td>0.070</td>
<td>1.354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian</td>
<td>-0.214</td>
<td>0.074</td>
<td>-2.879</td>
<td>-0.827</td>
<td>0.115</td>
<td>-7.165</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Obligatory Slide, too tiny to read; too detailed to matter.
Quantities of Interest, with uncertainty
What have we learned?

Context Matters

1. Violence doesn’t play the predicted role in expectations of cooperation.
2. Typical attitudinal measures are not statistically powerful in explaining expectations of cooperation.
3. Respondents from BiH are considerably more skeptical about ethnic cooperation than similar respondents in the North Caucasus areas of Russia.
4. Ascriptive characteristics are powerful, especially Age, Gender, and Nationality.
5. Ossetins are especially skeptical about the possibility of national cooperation, while Russians and Croats, for example, are more optimistic.
What have we learned?

Context Matters

1. Violence doesn’t play the predicted role in expectations of cooperation.
2. Typical attitudinal measures are not statistically powerful in explaining expectations of cooperation.
3. Respondents from BiH are considerably more skeptical about ethnic cooperation than similar respondents in the North Caucasus areas of Russia.
4. Ascriptive characteristics are powerful, especially Age, Gender, and Nationality.
5. Ossetins are especially skeptical about the possibility of national cooperation, while Russians and Croats, for example, are more optimistic.
6. Every one of these findings is relatively surprising.
The Road Ahead
Integration across Scales

1. Modelling spatial distributions
2. Integrating social similarities/dissimilarities
3. Events incorporated
4. More details (soon)
   http://www.colorado.edu/ibs/waroutcomes/