



# Social Science

# Discovering the Best Method of Judicial Selection: How Should State Supreme Court Justices be Placed onto the Bench?



Aaron Shaw Gafari

*The following is an excerpt from a longer piece. For full text, please visit [https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate\\_honors\\_theses/ng451j91n](https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate_honors_theses/ng451j91n)*

## Abstract

As the American Judiciary becomes a more active vehicle for progressing policy and partisanship, this paper examines what method of judicial selection we ought to prefer. That is, how we should prefer that state supreme court justices get to the bench. To answer this question, I first analyze the empirical data surrounding each of the four main and general selection methods used across states today (partisan elections, nonpartisan elections, merit selection, and appointment) and identify what general trends exist. Once these trends have been established, I then move into a philosophical discussion that asks what trends we ought to prefer in a given selection method, and what traits we ought to avoid. The question ends up being one of whether we should advocate for an independent judiciary, or one accountable to public opinion. I advocate for the former and the most independent selection method: merit selection.

## Part 1: Introduction

As the American Judiciary becomes a more active vehicle for progressing policy and partisanship, people are beginning to take a new-founded interest in the judicial processes of the United States. One of the big two-fold questions that constantly gets floated around is: who are these justices and how did they get onto the bench? From

this people begin to ask: granted that these justices are making such influential decisions, do we want them to be hidden from the public eye, or should they be held accountable to it? I seek to answer this latter question at the state level, and deliver a prescription with regards to what method of judicial selection we ought to prefer in today's America.

Judicial selection is the process by which judges are placed onto the bench in their state's supreme court. Judicial selection methods vary across states, but they tend to follow one of four main structures: partisan elections, nonpartisan elections, merit selection, or appointment. In partisan elections, judicial candidates have designated party affiliations and run in general elections, which typically come with primaries prior to the general election. The 6 states that use partisan elections include: AL, IL, LA, NC, PA, and TX. Nonpartisan elections function in a similar fashion but the candidates do not have a designated party affiliation. The 15 states that use this method are: AR, GA, ID, KY, MI, MN, MS, MT, NV, ND, OH, OR, WA, WI, and WV. Appointments are typically made through gubernatorial appointment where a governor chooses a judge, though a couple of states use legislative appointment where the legislature votes on a judge. For our purposes, both forms of appointment will be lumped into a single category. When lumping these two categories together, the 12 states that use appointment are: CT, DE, HI,

ME, NH, NJ, NY, RI, SC, VA, and VT...

In this paper I am going to argue that merit selection is the best method of judicial selection for state courts in the current American system. That is to say, I will present the case for why in today's political landscape we should prefer that state judges get to the bench by means of merit selection rather than appointments or elections. My inquiry will not concern what the best method of judicial selection would be given a set of hypothetical circumstances different from those that exist today. Instead, I am aiming to make a prescription that would be delivered if someone asked me at this moment: given the current state of politics and U.S. institutions, if you had to choose a single method of judicial selection to be used going forward across various states courts, which method would you choose?

To reach this argument, I will begin by surveying recent empirical data surrounding judicial selection and the different methods of selection. I will find what trends exist between the different selection methods with regards to five main criteria: productivity (how much work a judge accomplishes in a given amount of time), quality (how good is the work these judges are producing), independence (how much of a role do strategic considerations and irrelevant influences play on a judge deciding a given case), perceptions of legitimacy (what selection methods do the people find more or less legitimate), and diversity (does any selection method favor or disfavor minority judges more than another). The empirics will give us confident results in terms of independence, perceptions of legitimacy, and diversity, to show that merit selection produces the most independent judges, perceptions of legitimacy suffer when judicial selection becomes too political, and no method particularly advantages or disadvantages minorities. Some issues will arise with the indicators of productivity and quality that

prevent us from reaching confident conclusions about them and using them for extrapolation into a larger philosophical discussion.

Once these empirical trends are established, I will turn to a philosophical discussion that attaches normative judgements to these trends and argues that we ought to prefer an independent judiciary because it is the most likely to deliver us optimal outcomes and a healthy democracy. The former claim will rely on the idea that though there may be a truly right answer in a given case, there is a wide range of cases in which the right answer is either ambiguous or we are unable to track down the right answer. Thus, in such cases (which make up the bulk of the cases that supreme court justices deal with) we must rely on appealing to the decision-making processes that were used to form an opinion to indicate whether a judge is giving his most earnest efforts to uncover the right decision. This is to say that when rightness is tough to pin down (as it is for just about every case that hits a state supreme court justice's desk), all we can rely on is the most sound and rational line of reasoning. Such a decision-making process will be an independent one guided by rationality and free from strategic considerations. The latter claim about a healthy democracy will rely on the idea that to be truly democratic, a nation must account for the potential issues that can arise with pure majoritarianism and have an institution free from majoritarian influence where the minority can make his case on a level playing field. I will also mention that though elections can have some beneficial effect on democracy in terms of legitimacy, their politically charged nature tends to decrease aggregate legitimacy. From this I will conclude that the best method of judicial selection is merit selection because it is the most independent and least political one.

[...]

# The Influence of Extraversion on Political Polarization and Affective Forecasting



Connor Davis

*The following is an excerpt from a longer piece. For full text, please visit [https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate\\_honors\\_theses/d791sh52s](https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate_honors_theses/d791sh52s)*

## Abstract

In the United States, political division has continually worsened over the years, with the growing divide between the Left and Right leading to increased animosity between members of the two parties. This study explores this expanding division by analyzing the influence of political polarization on individuals' willingness to work for a humanitarian cause. Specifically, we examine if an individual's extraversion rating influences how long they spend on charitable tasks, or how long they predict they would spend on the task, and if the presence of cues associated with their in-group or out-group would influence their participation as well. This study does so by determining an association between extraversion and the assigned task type (predictor or engager) as well as between extraversion and the political party they identify with. It also looked at the correlation of extraversion and time spent on a charitable task supposedly sponsored by a control, co-partisan, or counter-partisan charity organization. Ultimately, we found no association between extraversion and the time spent on the charitable task, nor did we find a link in extraversion and party identification. This study ran into some limitations that may have impacted its overall results including time constraints and a singular focus placed on the personality trait of extraversion. This study demonstrated the importance of participation within prosocial activities and the implications of activities that influence this participation.

# Voter Turnout and Income Inequality in Latin America



Gabriella Gyurkovics

*The following is an excerpt from a longer piece. For full text, please visit [https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate\\_honors\\_theses/m900nv68b](https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate_honors_theses/m900nv68b)*

## Abstract

The purpose of this paper is to gain some insight into the age-old question: Why is there income inequality at all in our modern world? I narrow this question down into a sub-question that I can investigate: what is the effect of voter turnout on income inequality? I narrow my regional focus to Latin America and add a temporal focus to the years from 2000 to present. I theorize that higher voter turnout leads to decreased income inequality. This is because, as theorized by Lijphart (1996), low voter turnout is by and large a result of the people in low economic groups' failure to turn out to vote. Therefore, the alternate hypothesis of this thesis is that high voter turnout leads to more equal income distribution in Latin America from 2000 to present. I discover that I cannot reject my null hypothesis. There is not sufficient statistically significant evidence to believe that, based on a multivariate ordinary least squares regression analysis, increased voter turnout leads to increased income equality. This paper has implications for future researchers studying the effects of voter turnout in Latin America and for researchers interested in answering macroeconomic questions about this region.

## Introduction

Favelas in Brazil are neighborhoods that are ravaged by severe poverty. There are some favelas that are directly bordered by some of the

most expensive high-rise apartments complete with swimming pools, gardens, and tennis courts (see Appendix C). Why is there such a large difference between the rich and the poor in Latin America? There are countless potential reasons for high income inequality, but this paper examines the effect voter turnout has on income inequality.

The political science community has a longstanding understanding that there is a relationship between income inequality and voter turnout. Theoretical arguments, such as Lijphart's Presidential Address to the American Political Science Association (1996), provide a theory that higher voter turnout decreases income inequality. Lijphart argues that when turnout is low, it is due to an absence of people in low-income groups at the polls. Therefore, when turnout is high, more poor people turn out to vote and vote for candidates that will improve their economic standing. Boulding and Holzner (2020), however, find that in Latin America, one of the poorest and most unequal regions of the world, "poor people are just as politically active as more affluent individuals" (p. 98). The contradiction between these scholars is particularly interesting. This project empirically tests our current understanding of Latin American inequality and provides a quantitative ordinary least squares regression multivariate test of the effect of voter turnout on income inequality in Latin America.

I would like to understand the causes of

income inequality in Latin America, so I measure the impact of voter turnout on income inequality. I investigate the effects of voter turnout specifically because of the theory behind Arend Lijphart's Presidential Address to the American Political Science Foundation in 1996. In his address, Lijphart (1996) argues that "unequal turnout...is systematically biased against less well-to-do citizens" (p. 1). This is because unequal voter turnout usually means that those of a lesser economic position account for the missing votes. Therefore, if more low-income people voted, there would be less inequality because, according to the rational actor theory, they would vote for candidates that would improve their economic standing. An improvement in economic standing could be done with various political measures such as social welfare programs and tax benefits for the lower classes. Lijphart (1996) studies the United States for his conclusions presented in the Presidential Address, but I use the same principles and apply them to Latin America. I study Latin America specifically because it is an outlier in the world for high inequality and for high voter turnout. However, there is no significant relationship between voter turnout and income inequality in this region.

Based on Lijphart's Presidential Address (1996), one might conclude that a region as unequal as Latin America could significantly improve its income distribution by encouraging low-income individuals to turnout to vote. Boulding and Holzner (2020), however, find a different conclusion in Latin America. They find that when low-income people participate in community organizations, they participate in politics at high levels (Boulding & Holzner, 2020). This participation takes the form of political protest, contacting the government, and, most importantly for this project, voting. They argue that "community organizations help mobilize poor individuals both through the resources they

provide for mobilization and because they serve as sites where political parties target individuals for mobilization" (Boulding & Holzner, 2020, p. 98). Though Boulding and Holzner (2020) focus heavily on the effect of community organizations on political participation, their research has strong implications for this study. I study both work by Lijphart (1996) and by Boulding and Holzner (2020). Using an ordinary least squares regression test I find that there is no relationship between turnout and income inequality. This result, however, could be due to several causes that will be explored in depth later in this paper.

It is especially important to understand the determinants of income inequality in regions like Latin America because so many people live in poverty. In fact, 209 million people in Latin America live in poverty today (ECLAC, 2021). The Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (2021) explains that this is a result of the economic distress caused by the COVID-19 pandemic of 2020, but this is an alarmingly high number of impoverished people. This project is important to political scientists and law makers so that they understand the reality of the Latin American experience and can explore effective solutions to widespread poverty in the region.

Other scholars such as Lijphart (1996), Boulding and Holzner (2020), Carreras and Castañeda-Angarita (2014), and Carey and Horiuchi (2017) explain voter turnout and inequality on different levels and for different countries, but this gap in the established literature validates the theoretical impact of this project and the importance of the results.

[...]

## WORKS CITED

- Boulding, C., & Holzner, C. A. (2020). Community Organizations and Latin America's Poorest Citizens: Voting, Protesting, and Contacting Government. *Latin American Politics and Society*, 62(4), 98–125. <https://doi.org/10.1017/lap.2020.17>
- Carey, J. M., & Horiuchi, Y. (2017). Compulsory Voting and Income Inequality: Evidence for Lijphart's Proposition from Venezuela. *Latin American Politics and Society*, 59(2), 122– 144. <https://doi.org/10.1111/laps.12021>
- Carreras, M., & Castañeda-Angarita, N. (2014). Who Votes in Latin America? A Test of Three Theoretical Perspectives. *Comparative Political Studies*, 47(8), 1079–1104. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414013488558>
- Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC). (2021, March 4). Pandemic Prompts Rise in Poverty to Levels Unprecedented in Recent Decades and Sharply Affects Inequality and Employment | Press Release | Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean [Press release]. <https://www.cepal.org/en/pressreleases/pandemic-prompts-rise-poverty-levels-unprecedented-recent-decades-and-sharply-affects>
- Lijphart, A. J. (2021). Unequal Participation: Democracy's Unresolved Dilemma. 15. Madrid, R. (2005). Ethnic Cleavages and Electoral Volatility in Latin America. *Comparative Politics*, 38(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.2307/20072910>

# The Impact of Household Registration Restrictions and the Integration Reform on Urban-Rural Disposable Income Disparity in China

Zihan Zhang



*The following is an excerpt from a longer piece. For full text, please visit [https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate\\_honors\\_theses/d217qq90r](https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate_honors_theses/d217qq90r)*

## Abstract

This thesis studies the effects of the restrictions on the agriculture and non-agriculture household registration system often called urban and rural hukou, and its abolition on the disposable income disparity between urban and rural areas in China. This thesis uses the difference between the non-agriculture hukou and urbanization rates to measure the hukou limitation and its impact on income disparity in urban and rural areas. As for the integration reform, the study uses a dummy variable about before and after the integration reform and a dummy variable with additional regression specification of year to estimate the impact of such dichotomy on the income gap among Eastern, Western, and Central China. The results suggest that the stronger the hukou limitation, the more significant the income inequality between urban and rural areas, but the results are not valid in Eastern developed regions. The dual-track system has a more substantial impact on increasing the income gap in economically underdeveloped Western China. However, the thesis suggests that the integration reform cannot significantly diminish the income disparity between cities and the countryside.

## Introduction

This thesis studies two questions about the agricultural and non-agricultural household

registration system (hukou) in China: what is the impact of hukou limitation on the income disparity between urban and rural areas? Moreover, what is the impact of the hukou integration reform on the income disparity between urban and rural areas? According to the State Council Information Office (2021), Chinese people's mean income has significantly risen. The per capita disposable income has increased from 171 yuan in 1978 to 32,188 yuan in 2020 since the country adopted the reform and opening-up policy. From 1978 to 2020, the urban Engel coefficient decreased from 57.5% to 29.2%, and the Engel coefficient of rural residents fell from 67.7% to 32.7%. However, according to the Office for National Statistics (2022), the long-existing problem of the urban-rural income disparity has not been solved. The urban-rural disposable income ratio exceeded 3.00 in 2002 and even reached a historical peak of 3.14 in 2007. Although this incredible disparity no longer exists, the urban-rural income gap was still above 2.5 until 2021. The income gap between cities and the countryside is the most severe and long-standing problem that is difficult to solve in Chinese society. According to previous studies, hukou restrictions can increase the income gap between urban and rural areas.

After founding the People's Republic of China in 1949, China employed the Soviet Stalinist model with industrialization as its aim: using the rural surplus to support urban development. In 1958,



to diminish migration from rural to urban areas, the Chinese government issued Regulations on Household Registration of the People's Republic of China to restrict rural-urban mobility. The Chinese government classified all people as agricultural or non-agricultural hukou based on the regulations. The government tied rural people to their land, and if they wanted to convert their rural hukou to urban hukou, it was severely limited and challenging. As a decree to support industrialization, it aimed to limit the unwelcome rural to urban mobility (Chan, 2010). Urban citizens could enjoy better welfare than rural citizens, including better education, medical care, pension, and employment. During the planned economy period, rural people needed to get urban hukou if they wanted to settle in cities because of the enormous welfare differences. After the reform and opening-up policy, the welfare gap based on household registration gradually decreased, but it still existed (Zhou et al., 2022). Because of the relaxed restrictions, after the 1980s, millions of people could work in cities even if they had rural hukou (Fields and Song, 2013).

In Table 5, the government used five-stage reform policies to relax the hukou limitations after the opening-up and reform. The social mobility from rural to urban areas was not strictly restricted. From 1978 to 2001, eligible farmers could get non-agricultural hukou, and the government gradually reduced the requirement for obtaining a non-agricultural hukou. After 2002, some provinces no longer recorded residents' hukou nature, but most provinces still showed their hukou locations, and the integration reform could not wholly diminish the welfare gap between urban and rural residents. In order to further reduce the hukou restrictions, The State Council issued opinions on further promoting the reform of the household registration system in 2014. By January 1, 2017, all provinces had abolished the division of agriculture and non-agriculture

hukou and unified registration as resident hukou. The reform also includes establishing education, health, employment, social security, housing, and population statistics systems compatible with the resident household registration system.

This thesis uses panel data from 31 province-level administrative regions in China from 2007 to 2019. This thesis employs the urban and rural disposable income ratios to compare income differentials. It also used dummy variables with additional year regression specifications to examine the long-term and short-term effects of the household registration integration reform on the urban-rural income ratio. At the same time, the methodology adds control indicators such as some primary macro data, such as the education gap between urban and rural areas, age structure, etc. It controls the province fixed effects and year fixed effects in the methodology.

Previous studies have studied the effect of hukou restrictions on the rural-urban development disparity, which is the result of principal component analysis of different indicators rather than just the income gap (Li & Hu, 2015). Compared with previous studies, this thesis analyzes the impact of hukou restrictions on the urban-rural income gap at the macro level and the change in the annual income gap before and after the hukou integration reform to study whether this policy would have a significant impact on the income gap. Compared with Song (2015), which suggests that there is gender discrimination on income, this paper indicates that the impact of gender ratio on wage differences between urban residents and rural residents is not significant. This thesis also studies the impact of age structure, family size, agricultural modernization, educational level, economic growth, divorce rate, urbanization rate, healthcare, and infrastructure on urban-rural income inequality in China.

This thesis has found that hukou

limitations can increase the urban-rural income ratio in economically underdeveloped Western and Central regions. However, there is insufficient evidence to show that the integration reform can reduce the income disparity after using a dummy variable to compare the income gap change before and after the reform, especially by adding additional specifications of year. Urbanization, infrastructure, and agricultural mechanization developments

can positively reduce the urban-rural income inequalities. Reducing the education level and healthcare differences between urban and rural areas can also reduce income inequalities. However, the impacts of economic growth, age structure, family size, gender ratio, and divorce rate on the urban-rural income gap are not significant.  
[...]

### WORKS CITED

- Chan, K. W. (2010). The Household Registration System and Migrant Labor in China: Notes on a Debate. *Population and Development Review*, 36(2), 357–364. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1728-4457.2010.00333.x>
- Fields, G. S., & Song, Y. (2013). A Theoretical Model of the Chinese Labor Market. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2238311>
- Li, Y., & Hu, Z. (2015). Approaching Integrated Urban-Rural Development in China: The Changing Institutional Roles. *Sustainability*, 7(6), 7031–7048. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su7067031>
- National Bureau of Statistics. (2022). National Data. Chinese Government. <https://data.stats.gov.cn/>
- Song, Y. (2015). Hukou-based labor market discrimination and ownership structure in urban China. *Urban Studies*, 53(8), 1657–1673. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0042098015576861>
- The State Council Information Office. (2021). China's Epic Journey from Poverty to Prosperity. *Xinhua*. [http://english.www.gov.cn/archive/whitepaper/202109/28/content\\_WS61528550c6d0df57f98e0ffa.html](http://english.www.gov.cn/archive/whitepaper/202109/28/content_WS61528550c6d0df57f98e0ffa.html)
- Zhou, J., Lin, L., Tang, S., & Zhang, S. (2022). To settle but not convert hukou among rural migrants in urban China: How does family-level eligibility for citizenship benefits matter? *Habitat International*, 120, 102511. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.habitat.2022.102511>

# Imagining ‘Home’: Undergraduate Housing Insecurity in the Time of the COVID-19 Pandemic

Zac Clement

*The following is an excerpt from a longer piece. For full text, please visit [https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate\\_honors\\_theses/bg257g39h](https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate_honors_theses/bg257g39h)*

## Introduction

Home is not only a physical structure that provides shelter; it is also a place with deep social and interpersonal meanings. These meanings come from various social processes that construct a sense of home that depends on a person’s security, sense of belonging, and community (Butler & Hamnett, 2012; Manzo, 2003; Pitkanen, 2017; van Lanen, 2020). Past studies have emphasized the importance of a holistic understanding of what home means to individuals when assessing conflicts and other social issues related to the domestic sphere, going beyond the security implied by the existence of a physical structure.

The COVID-19 pandemic created an environment where many people were forced to shelter in place, no matter where they were. Understanding how people imagine their home is necessary to understanding their experience of the pandemic, as people with different housing situations were affected by the pandemic in different ways. Students specifically were in a unique situation in terms of housing for the pandemic, with many universities closing student residences. An underdeveloped area of research in the field of housing insecurity is how these college students imagine their home when they are attending school. While undergraduate students are not a monolith, home is a difficult concept to define as there are many factors that change a student’s connections

to place while attending school (McAndrew, 1998; Turley, 2006). This can manifest in ways like homesickness or planning to return to their familial home after college. Traditional undergraduate students are typically thought to leave their family homes to go to college, leaving a question of where they might consider their home to be, if it is one place. Additionally, there are many non-traditional college students who are often overlooked when discussing undergraduates in higher education (Gilardi & Guglielmetti, 2011). These students’ conceptions of home may differ from traditional students, necessitating further research into how they imagine ‘home.’

The transition from a parental home to a home of one’s own is a moment of insecurity in the best of times. But insecurity becomes far more intense in a time of pandemic in an already expensive college town with little rental stock. Housing insecurity encompasses many kinds of problems that people might run into with their housing situations including affordability, quality, safety, and loss (Broton & Goldrick-Rab, 2018). These different metrics create a broad definition where people may not be aware that they qualify as housing insecure because they have a physical shelter. Furthermore, past research has shown that homelessness and housing insecurity have a wide range of detrimental effects across different populations (Fantuzzo et al., 2012; Seastres et al.,

2020); however, the current research does not adequately address the unique needs of college students experiencing housing insecurity. There have been some preliminary studies at various universities in the United States that attempt to collect data about the rate of housing insecurity at these institutions to inform university housing policy (Crutchfield & Maguire, 2017; Tsui et al., 2011). These studies have shown high rates of housing insecurity among college students, mainly exhibited by students not being able to afford rent, prompting a need for more discussion around the topic, especially on how to best support housing insecure students. Additionally, many of these studies use a purely quantitative approach to data collection, leaving a large gap in our understanding of how housing insecure populations imagine their home, and how this conception of home influences their housing struggles.

Throughout the COVID-19 pandemic, the concept of home was used in a variety of ways. Across the United States, 'stay-at-home' policies were enacted to slow the spread of the virus through physical distancing. These policies often assumed that people had a home to remain in, as well as imagining the home to be a mostly positive space, which is not always true (Bullinger et al., 2021; Kaukinen, 2020). Through assuming a stable home that everybody could safely stay in, marginalized groups were further pushed to the fringes of society and policy spaces, making them more vulnerable to both housing insecurity and COVID-19 itself. While there has been some research highlighting cases where home might not be a safe place during the pandemic, there is little literature that critically examines how home is imagined when looking at these experiences. Fujita et al. (2020) studied the effects of the pandemic and stay-at-home orders on unhoused people in Japan; however, similar studies on the US do not currently exist. This study also did not address how these people

might have an imagined view of home outside of what is culturally expected, and how that worked in the context of stay-at-home policies. Beyond just housing, the negative effects of the pandemic were not felt equally, with marginalized and disadvantaged populations bearing the brunt of the hardships of the pandemic (Chen & Krieger, 2021; Henning Smith et al., 2020; Michèle et al., 2021). The pandemic can be seen as a period of crisis, which puts stress on already-strained resources and populations, leading to a worsening of economic and housing conditions.

The pandemic also caused a lot of changes for college students as in-person learning shifted to be entirely remote. CU Boulder closed the dorms in March 2020 and told students to return home if they could (From the Chancellor – COVID-19 Update, 2020). For those without a stable home off-campus, or others with circumstances that did not allow them to travel home at that point in time, the campus policies directly impacted their housing security. There has been very little information given publicly to support those students throughout the duration of the pandemic, and not much is known about the marginalized groups that might have been disproportionately affected by the campus' COVID-19 policies. Additionally, Boulder was already a city that does not have easily accessible affordable housing (Fluri et al., 2020), meaning many students might have started from a place of insecurity before the pandemic happened. The present study aimed to do two things:

1. Investigate how students at CU Boulder imagine their home in a transitional period of their lives when in college.
2. Assess how the COVID-19 pandemic has affected housing insecurity among undergraduate students at CU Boulder.

I used mixed qualitative and quantitative methods in this study through semi-structured interviews and surveys. The interviews provided

qualitative data as to how students handle the transition to college in terms of home-making, as well as specific experiences during the COVID-19 pandemic. To supplement this qualitative data, I used a survey to better understand the scope of housing insecurity during the pandemic at CU Boulder and examine how different demographic variables might affect these experiences. I hypothesized that the COVID-19 pandemic worsened already existing housing insecurity by hurting the economic situation of many students.

Furthermore, the policies created in response to the pandemic employed an idea of 'home' that does not align with the actual experiences of students, further exacerbating housing insecurity. My work adds to the growing geographic scholarship on the idea of home beyond a physical structure by demonstrating how students imagine a place to be their home through relationships and community, especially in times of crisis.

[...]

### WORKS CITED

- Broton, K. M., & Goldrick-Rab, S. (2018). Going Without: An Exploration of Food and Housing Insecurity Among Undergraduates. *Educational Researcher*, 47(2), 121–133. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X17741303>
- Bullinger, L. R., Carr, J. B., & Packham, A. (2021). COVID-19 and Crime: Effects of Stay-at-Home Orders on Domestic Violence. *American Journal of Health Economics*, 7(3), 249–280. <https://doi.org/10.1086/713787>
- Butler, T., & Hamnett, C. (2012). Social Geographic Interpretations of Housing Spaces. In *The SAGE Handbook of Housing Studies* (pp. 147–162). SAGE Publications Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446247570>
- Chen, J. T., & Krieger, N. (2021). Revealing the Unequal Burden of COVID-19 by Income, Race/Ethnicity, and Household Crowding: US County Versus Zip Code Analyses. *Journal of Public Health Management and Practice*, 27(1), S43–S56. <https://doi.org/10.1097/PHH.0000000000001263>
- Crutchfield, R. M., & Maguire, J. (2017). Researching Basic Needs in Higher Education. California State University Office of the Chancellor.
- Fantuzzo, J. W., LeBoeuf, W. A., Chen, C.-C., Rouse, H. L., & Culhane, D. P. (2012). The Unique and Combined Effects of Homelessness and School Mobility on the Educational Outcomes of Young Children. *Educational Researcher*, 41(9), 393–402. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X12468210>
- Fluri, J. L., Hickcox, A., Frydenlund, S., & Zackary, R. (2020). Accessing racial privilege through property: Geographies of racial capitalism. *Geoforum*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2020.06.013>
- From the Chancellor - COVID-19 Update: Additional guidance on housing and operations. (2020, March 16). Office of the Chancellor. <https://www.colorado.edu/chancellor/newsletter/chancellor/covid-19-update-additional-guidance-housing-and-operations>
- Fujita, M., Matsuoka, S., Kiyohara, H., Kumakura, Y., Takeda, Y., Goishi, N., Tarui, M., Inaba, M., Nagai, M., Hachiya, M., & Fujita, N. (2020). "Staying at home" to tackle COVID-19 pandemic: Rhetoric or reality? Cross-cutting analysis of nine population groups vulnerable to homelessness in Japan. *Tropical Medicine and Health*, 48(1), 92. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s41182-020-00281-0>
- Gilardi, S., & Guglielmetti, C. (2011). University Life of Non-Traditional Students: Engagement Styles and Impact on Attrition. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 82(1), 33–53. <https://doi.org/10.1353/jhe.2011.0005>
- Henning Smith, C., Tuttle, M., & Kozhimannil, K. B. (2020). Unequal Distribution of COVID 19 Risk among Rural Residents by Race and Ethnicity. *The Journal of Rural Health*, 10.1111/jrh.12463. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jrh.12463>
- Kaukinen, C. (2020). When Stay-at-Home Orders Leave Victims Unsafe at Home: Exploring the Risk and Consequences of Intimate Partner Violence during the COVID-19 Pandemic. *American Journal of Criminal Justice*, 45(4), 668–679. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12103-020-09533-5>
- Manzo, L. C. (2003). Beyond house and haven: Toward a revisioning of emotional relationships with places. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 23(1), 47–61. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0272-4944\(02\)00074-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0272-4944(02)00074-9)
- McAndrew, F. T. (1998). THE MEASUREMENT OF 'ROOTEDNESS' AND THE PREDICTION OF ATTACHMENT TO HOME-TOWNS IN COLLEGE STUDENTS. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 18(4), 409–417. <https://doi.org/10.1006/jevp.1998.0078>
- Michèle, B., Syngjoo, C., Egon, T., den, B.-A. E. van, Jamison, J. C., & Papageorge, N. W. (2021). Unequal consequences of Covid 19: Representative evidence from six countries. *Review of Economics of the Household*, 19(3), 769–783. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/>

s11150-021-09560-z

- Pitkanen, L. (2017). The state comes home: Radiation and in-situ dispossession in Canada. *Political Geography*, 61, 99–109. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polgeo.2017.06.016>
- Seastres, R. J., Hutton, J., Zordan, R., Moore, G., Mackelprang, J., Kiburg, K. V., & Sundararajan, V. (2020). Long-term effects of homelessness on mortality: A 15-year Australian cohort study. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Public Health*, 44(6), 476–481. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1753-6405.13038>
- Tsui, E., Freudenberg, N., Manzo, L., Jones, H., Kwan, A., & Gagnon, M. (2011). A Report from: The Campaign for a Healthy CUNY. 8.
- Turley, R. N. L. (2006). When Parents Want Children to Stay Home for College. *Research in Higher Education*, 47(7), 823–846. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11162-006-9017-4>
- van Lanen, S. (2020). 'My room is the kitchen': Lived experience of home-making, home-unmaking and emerging housing strategies of disadvantaged urban youth in austerity Ireland. *Social & Cultural Geography*, 0(0), 1–22. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14649365.2020.1783350>



# What's In a Name?

Forrest Becker

## Research Statement

Prior to my travel to East Africa I eagerly told my friends in the United States about my journey to-come. A sentiment echoed throughout a number of these friends was “why?” They wanted to know why I wasn’t traveling to somewhere of great luxury like Europe or somewhere with world-renowned food like Southeast Asia. The outside, Western definition of Tanzania is two-fold: wildlife and poverty. While this image holds truth in some regards, it is wholly unrepresentative of the diverse ontologies at play within the country. These misconceptions can stem from a lot of places, but one of the most pertinent and deep-scarring of which is that of toponyms or names in general.

A toponym can be any sort of term applied to a location; anything from London to Taumatawhakatangihangakoauauotamatea-turipukakapikimaungahoronukupokaiwhenuakitanatahu. Two different groups can have two distinct toponyms for a location, like Barrow and Utqiagvik, the latter of which was the original, indigenous name which has since been reclaimed. Some toponyms stem from indigenous terms, while some have been replaced by colonial or imperial powers, and some have been adjusted to be more useful, respectful, or accurate. Local, indigenous terms have a value, not only in their practical application, but also in their implications on cultural and national identities. But too often,

these toponyms are misspelled, misinterpreted, or pasted over with more Westernized alternatives. Preservation of indigenous toponyms must be done carefully, as readily abolishing existing, incorrect place-names can lead to more systematic changes down the road. Certainly there is no one-size-fits-all approach to naming locations. Instead a system of community-based, localized corrections should be followed.

Toponyms are just one of the cartographic conventions that are used to develop countries. But the development strategies that work for the countries of the Global West when applied in the same way to countries of the Global South can detrimentally stunt the progress possible within a country. The concept of a split world, the West versus the rest, or the developed compared to the underdeveloped is a damaging one. The notion that development is a series of processes to be refined in the West and then spread to the rest of the world ignores any niche development strategies already in place. Toponyms too can take on this role, being used to oppress and impair the countries of what is known as the “Global South.” It is necessary to understand spatial and cultural nuance between regions so as not to ignore such strategies. The systems that are already working in a given location are the ones most important to preserve and expand rather than the foreign ones. Historically, mapping practices like toponyms or establishing borders



have been used only to enrich the countries of the Global West and to debilitate all others. Because of this history of misdevelopment, to my friends in America, Tanzania's definition was one of subservience, destitution, and otherness.

As a foreigner, it is important to understand the context of these misdevelopments. As I write this paper, each word choice needs to be especially conscientious. Misspellings can mean that a whole village becomes invisible to the outside world. An out-of-use term or toponym can be derogatory or can generate an unrealistic depiction of the world. It is entirely possible that this writing fails some of these goals, but that is very much within the nature of engaging with such unique and sensitive subjects. We, as a global society, need to be exposed to these dialogues and terminologies if we hope to achieve global development in any capacity.

### **Cultural / Historical Context**

The most widely-acknowledged standard for development is the United Nations' Human Development Index (HDI) which calculates the development of a state or administrative district based on its life expectancy, education, and Gross National Income. This index "does not reflect on inequalities, poverty, human security, empowerment, etc." (United Nations 2022) and fails to indicate any value in the countries seen as "least developed." Nevertheless, the HDI is the public perception, at least in the West, for which countries have and do not have development. These preconceptions can be harmful to countries on the "less developed" side of the spectrum generally known as the Global South, and can negatively influence aspects of their economies, international relations, and public images.

Through the colonization of Africa, a sovereign territory did not exist in Tanzania's place until 1961, and only took on the name Tanzania after Tanganyika and Zanzibar merged their names

and jurisdictions. Prior to that point, there was a confluence of terms from German, British, and Indigenous terminology. Tanzania also accepts much of its language from Arabic, Indian, and English influences. The Kiswahili language was adopted under the country's first president, Julius Nyerere. The basis for this was to choose a language which would serve as a uniting force for the four different language groups present in the country as well as for the non-indigenous population. The language received criticism from the outside world, with many perceiving it as a non-serious language, one without sophistication or refinement. Nyerere took it upon himself to translate whole Shakespeare works into Kiswahili to prove that all the nuance of a major world language like English was possible with a local, East African language.

Beyond language, the Father of the Country, or Baba Wa Taifa, aspired to develop Tanzania along a plan that would be agreeable to his population. Nyerere wrote The Arusha Declaration and TANU's Policy on Socialism and Self Reliance, in which he argues that "the development of a country is brought about by people, not by money. Money, and the wealth it represents, is the result and not the basis of development" (1967) and instead this basis is people, land, good policies, and good leadership. Nyerere's Declaration is the best-known writing on African Socialism, which stands in contrast to Chinese or Soviet socialism, but also rejects the policy and outreach of the Global West. Nyerere's Ujamaa Village plan "was socialism in that it envisaged collective ownership of the means of production, but it did not lay stress upon central control of the economy, industrialization or class analysis" (Rist 2019) and was at its core a method of self-reliance through villagization of the economy. Six presidents later, the impact of Nyerere's revolutionary vision for development is still felt throughout the country. Tanzanians use Nyerere's Ujamaa plan as inspiration for clever and



unique development not seen anywhere else in the world. Tanzania struggles with poverty as well as the balance between wildlife conservation and indigenous people but to only see these aspects of the country would be selling Tanzania's value far short.

## Reflection

One of the most wide reaching developments of the modern day is digitization and the internet. We often boast that anything we should like to know is at our fingertips with websites like Google. While the benefit of the internet is its extensive information and ability to connect its users over great distances, small inaccuracies can go unnoticed but spell massive difficulties for those implicated. Embooret is a Maasai village in the Manyara region of Tanzania that encompassed 8,860 persons as of 2012 (National Bureau of Statistics 2013). While in the region, we stayed with a few locals who were in charge of some activities, guarded the camp, and talked with us about their village. When one man named Loolayook told us that the name of the village was "Embooret" I asked him if it was spelled "Emboreet" and he told me that no, that must have been a different village. The reason I had asked this was because I had heard extensively about Emboreet Village, was told it was a place we would visit, and had read its name in books and on maps. In the digital world, there exists no record of a place called "Embooret," only the misspelling "Emboreet." Even the census data I referenced holds no mention of Embooret, and yet the two locations are spatially the same. The village of Embooret does not exist in any known way outside of what its own inhabitants know it to be called.

Embooret is an agropastoralist Maasai village, which means their rural economic activity focuses on raising livestock which is supplemented

with some crop-growing. Olasiti shows the Maasai making an economic transition from rural pastoralism to agriculturalism and animal husbandry. The Maasai who live in this urban-adjacent community have even changed their name from Maasai to Waarusha, indicating a wholly distinct culture and lifestyle from their Maasai heritage. While touring Olasiti, I asked Zenan, a local man and our guide for the day, if each road had its own name. I was shocked to hear that, indeed, they did. Even the smaller alleyways had names known by nearly everyone in the community. My surprise stemmed from my prior exploration of the region on Google Maps, Google Earth, and Apple Maps, which yielded few if any toponyms across the entire region. None of the individual context, nuance, or indigenous knowledge is at all accessible by the outside world.

It is hard to understate the value of simple navigational toponyms, though for Tanzania it would be nearly impossible to navigate without a local guide. When I asked one of our trip-guides and drivers, Kisana, whether he uses any GPS, he was unfamiliar with the concept. Google Maps claims that driving and walking directions are "available in the area, with good data quality and availability" (2022), the same designation it gives to the United States of America in these criteria. This blatant failure to fill in valuable toponyms is not isolated to this region. The nearby regional capital city of Arusha has the same problem, despite being the third largest city in the country. If companies like Google and Apple have any interest in expanding their userbase in countries like Tanzania, it will be essential to rely on indigenous knowledge to develop their applications.

These misspellings and ignorances exist everywhere in Tanzania. A man named Mamus from Oltukai village pointed out a misspelling in a book I showed him. A group of maps had misspelled

the nearby Esilalei village as “Easalei.” For many Tanzanians, cartographic errors like this obscure the intended cultural functions of toponyms. But just because a name is misspelled or misinterpreted does not mean that the correct course of action is to rename or correct these errors.

Because of Tanzania’s complex colonial history, many locations now exist and operate with misspelled toponyms. Olduvai Gorge is often referred to as “The Cradle of Civilization” for its invaluable archeological contributions to modern understanding of human development. Olduvai is a British-colonial misspelling of the word Oldupai, a local plant. I asked our guide at the location, Susan, why they continue to use the incorrect terminology if the correction is so well-known. She told me that changing the name might bring more trouble than it would value. So many documents and databases have Olduvai labeled as such that changing its name now would create many more systematic problems for the site than just accepting the name as is. It is important to understand that just because a location has been misnamed does not mean it should always be changed back. Ultimately, this nuance will always best be understood by local, often indigenous, voices.

Disrespect for indigenous terminologies can be harmful to cultural identities as well as their place in society. Misportrayal of indigenous toponyms can impact an indigenous individual’s ability to receive a job or a loan. If a foreign donor cannot find a village on a map, they may be reluctant to provide funding for the village’s projects. Now, in the digital age, more than ever, it is essential to recognize inconsistencies in portrayal of indigenous terms and involve indigenous voices in their corrections. One of the fields that most heavily needs this is the conservation sector. Indigenous peoples already hold an ethic for conservation and stewardship and have more vested interest

in conservation efforts than large corporations or conservation interests. Tribes like the Maasai or the Iraqw are in closer contact with the wildlife and ecosystem services unique to East Africa. It stands to reason that these tribes would be the most capable of preserving biodiversity. Unfortunately, conservation organizations see indigenous peoples more as a threat than a support system. Eviction of adjacent or included indigenous communities is a growing problem in Ngorongoro Conservation Area and Manyara Ranch Conservancy. This is a travesty. To separate a society from one of its foundational values, that of sustainability and proximity to nature, is to commit an atrocity.

All is not yet lost for the indigenous populations of Tanzania. A growing movement in indigenous politics which favors indigenous terminologies and sciences has begun to make strides worldwide. A recognition for a Maasai man’s ability to understand complex grazing patterns in Wildebeest is just as valuable as a traditionally educated foreigner. Encouraging this diversity is essential to any modern business or political model. Similarly, recognition of indigenous toponyms is essential to constructing a landscape of inclusivity and constructive dialogues.

## **Conclusions / Future Direction**

Development can never be approached from a one-size-fits-all, top-down approach. No country is merely “better developed” than another. Some countries might have further developments in technology, economy, or human health, but identifying a people as underdeveloped ignores the developments they do have, which are often more applicable to their own situations than those of a foreign metropole. Tanzania sets a shining example of respect for indigenous ontologies with its history of rejecting the development options of the Global North and ethic for adaptability. Forcing

an American or Chinese development strategy onto Tanzania would only serve to debilitate and devalue local successes.

Indigenous peoples across Tanzania have to put up with a lot of poor development decisions which too often fail to involve them. Nevertheless, Tanzanians are especially successful in their own, local developments. Findings suggest that bottom-up development strategies are successful “in that they are small-scale; rely on adapting indigenous technologies or systems of land-water-use management; and that any outside assistance they receive is flexible and low-cost” (Black 113). This sort of development is praised by experts specifically for focusing on “adapting” that which is already in use. While in Tanzania, we observed many women breaking rocks into gravel to be sold. We saw mangrove saplings being grown out of old flower pots to bolster coastal wetlands. Kisana told us that when families fall on hard times with their personal businesses or farms, they will often find alternative sources of income until they can find something

more sustainable. This culture of hard work and adaptability is integral to the Tanzanian national identity and reflective of Nyerere’s vision for self-sufficiency from global superpowers. This culture needs to be recognized worldwide and recognized in its ability to provide substantial, positive changes to fields like entrepreneurship, politics, and especially conservation.

One way to support indigenous peoples in these situations is by honoring land rights and establishing land titles which legally bind a tribe’s ownership over a portion of land. We saw this with the Hunter-Gatherer Hadza tribe, who lost over 90% of their original land but acquired a land title and were able to preserve the remaining portion of land. Another is by further involving indigenous voices and epistemologies in higher-level management of these projects. Development cannot ignore the ways-of-knowing that tribes like the Maasai are able to provide to discussions surrounding conservation.

### WORKS CITED

- Black, Maggie. “5 Enter Sustainability.” *The No-Nonsense Guide to International Development*, New Internationalist, Oxford, 2013, pp. 94–115.
- Google Maps. “Google Maps Platform Coverage Details.” *Google Maps Platform Coverage Details* | Google Developers, Google, 27 July 2022, <https://developers.google.com/maps/coverage#coverage-legend>.
- National Bureau of Statistics. “2012 Population and Housing Census.” *CountrySTAT*, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, 2013, [http://tanzania.countrystat.org/fileadmin/user\\_upload/countrystat\\_fenix/congo/docs/Census%20General%20Report-2012PHC.pdf](http://tanzania.countrystat.org/fileadmin/user_upload/countrystat_fenix/congo/docs/Census%20General%20Report-2012PHC.pdf).
- Nyerere, Julius. “The Arusha Declaration and TANU’s Policy on Socialism and Self Reliance.” *The Arusha Declaration* by Julius Nyerere 1967, 5 Feb. 1967, <https://www.marxists.org/subject/africa/nyerere/1967/arusha-declaration.htm>.
- Rist, Gilbert. “8 Self-Reliance: The Communal Past As A Model For The Future.” *The History Of Development From Western Origins To Global Faith*, translated by Patrick Camiller, Fifth ed., Zed Books Ltd, London, England, 2019, pp. 123–139.
- United Nations. “Human Development Index.” *Human Development Reports*, 29 Mar. 2022, <https://hdr.undp.org/data-center/human-development-index#/indicies/HDI>.

# **Life Satisfaction Among Undergraduate Students: Correlates with Body Appreciation, Athlete Self-Identification, and Exercise Frequency**

Grace Leger

*The following is an excerpt from a longer piece. For full text, please visit [https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate\\_honors\\_theses/w6634514d](https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate_honors_theses/w6634514d)*

## **Abstract**

Personal identity, body perceptions, and lifestyles have been researched and documented for decades. However, several athlete versus non-athlete lifestyles and characteristics have yet to be documented. Low life satisfaction is extremely common on college campuses today, with clinical depression (resulting from low life satisfaction) being the leading mental illness among college students. The current study uses a self-report questionnaire to examine how college students' life satisfaction is impacted by athlete self-identification, body appreciation, and exercise frequency. From this research, implications such as exercise interventions can be implemented to improve life satisfaction and mental health. The following research used bivariate correlations and a multiple regression analysis to examine these variables. Body appreciation was found to be significantly correlated with life satisfaction. Meanwhile, body appreciation and life satisfaction were individually associated with athlete self-identification. Further research is needed to confirm results of the study across different populations.



# Between a Rock and a Hard Place: Examining Preschool Teachers' Workplace Experiences and their Influences on Exclusionary Discipline



Avery Brogle

*The following is an excerpt from a longer piece. For full text, please visit [https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate\\_honors\\_theses/q811kk96s](https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate_honors_theses/q811kk96s)*

## Abstract

Preschool expulsions are increasingly studied in terms of their potential negative outcomes on students. This study examined the relationship between preschool teachers' workplace experiences and their use of disciplinary actions, including expulsions. It sought to understand the sociological mechanisms and supports of the teacher workplace, and the psychological influences on teacher decision making and perceptions that contribute to disciplinary actions. Whereas prior research has illustrated the harmful consequences of expulsions and how teacher experiences may be related to expulsions, this study aimed to increase knowledge about the influence of workplace factors on discipline, primarily in private preschools, which are relatively under-studied. Preschool teachers from the Denver area participated in semi-structured interviews to gain understanding about their stress, perceptions of challenging behaviors, perceived institutional support, and institutional norms regarding discipline. Using open-coding methods, the qualitative data was analyzed and several key themes were established. The findings indicate that preschool teachers generally lack adequate support, especially in regard to challenging behavior management, and that this creates a great deal of stress. Additionally, although preschool expulsions may be declining, they are being replaced by other exclusionary disciplines, including "soft" expulsions to mitigate teacher stress in the absence of knowledge on how to actively improve challenging behaviors. These findings have important implications as they show there needs to be easily accessible training opportunities concentrated on how to handle challenging behaviors and more opportunities for workplace collaboration to better support teachers in dealing with these behaviors, and thus mitigating the negative consequences of exclusionary discipline.

# Can Regulating Large Satellite Constellations as Monopolies Improve Sustainability Standards While Providing Effective and Equitable Internet Access?

Samuel Rodgers

*The following is an excerpt from a longer piece. For full text, please visit [https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate\\_honors\\_theses/5138jg42t](https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate_honors_theses/5138jg42t)*



## Abstract

Large satellite constellations (LSC) in Low Earth Orbit (LEO) provide the means to deliver internet to previously underserved populations. The LSC's economic potential combined with a growing demand for internet access has led to multiple companies pledging their own internet LSCs in hopes of capitalizing on this need. This, in addition to growing interest in LEO, risks destabilizing the LEO environment if not regulated properly. The current U.S. Orbital Debris Standard Mitigation Practices (USODSMP) are woefully outdated and only sporadically followed by operators. Furthermore, there are no licensing regulations for other key sustainability requirements, such as propulsion and tracking. Accelerated growth of internet LSCs without proper regulation will lead to an unsafe and unsustainable LEO environment. There needs to be a change in how governments regulate private and public LSCs, in particular those providing internet telecommunications. Internet LSCs are the fastest growing population in LEO, often directly competing for orbits and broadband frequencies.

In this thesis, I investigate whether the U.S. could apply aspects of terrestrial utility infrastructure to better regulate satellite internet. In particular, I question whether the U.S. government could regulate internet LSCs as monopolies. Such regulatory control would allow the U.S. to better enforce and revise sustainability regulations and ensure fair access to internet services. Viewing internet as a utility—as a necessity of modern life to which all citizens deserve access—this thesis proposes the U.S. license a single internet LSC from within its borders. I explored two potential regulatory approaches: one based on the U.S.'s public utility system and one based on European internet infrastructure. I then presented these approaches to five experts in the field of space sustainability and solicited their feedback. From these results, I determined that both of my regulatory approaches are not feasible in their current forms within the U.S.; however, both approaches produce potential partial applications and variations of their initial design that may find traction. This thesis concludes that adopting an interoperability framework in LEO would allow for precise and targeted sustainability, technology, and capacity standards for each orbital corridor, empower regulatory bodies to enforce these standards, and preserve competition among Commercial Satellite Operators (CSOs). Finally, a government internet LSC competing against commercial internet LSCs, akin to terrestrial municipal internet, would demonstrate technological feasibility, satisfy equity requirements, and provide a baseline LSC for CSOs to compete against.

# Betrayed by the Divine and Overlooked by Scholarship: An Inquiry into Spiritual Abuse and Religious Trauma



Lillian Bisantz

*The following is an excerpt from a longer piece. For full text, please visit [https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate\\_honors\\_theses/kw52j957x](https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/undergraduate_honors_theses/kw52j957x)*

## Introduction

In May 2022 an investigative report into the Southern Baptist Convention's (SBC) mishandling of sexual abuse allegations was released, uncovering the suppression and protection of information by the Executive Committee involving over 380 SBC-affiliated abusers who had either been convicted or pled guilty to sex crimes against over 700 victims since 1998.<sup>1</sup> The report highlighted the insidious culture of sexual abuse across all levels of engagement—from youth pastor leaders to those in the highest positions of power—within the largest Protestant denomination in the country. This report comes twenty years after the scathing 2002 Boston Globe exposé that found that over seventy clerics within the

Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Boston had been accused of child molestation, and the Church had been actively involved in keeping the settlements secret.<sup>2</sup> Solving the problem often meant handling the legal proceedings internally, paying victims off, and geographically relocating abusive clerics.<sup>3</sup> This exposé inspired a broader investigation into the U.S. Roman Catholic Church, which found that between 1950 and 2022, over 10,600 victims had accused more than 4,300 priests of child abuse.<sup>4</sup> Not only was the Church not protecting the victims of child sexual abuse, but they were also protecting the perpetrators.

One of the largest Buddhist organizations in the West, Shambhala International, is also undergoing its own reckoning after the release of three reports exposing sexual

---

1 Thomas Fuller, "Southern Baptist Convention Says It Faces Federal Investigation for Sexual Abuse," *The New York Times*, August 12, 2022, <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/08/12/us/southern-baptist-convention-sexual-abuse.html>. 2

2 The original article, "Church allowed abuse by priest for years" was published January 6, 2002 and focused on the knowledge of Father John Geoghan's sexual abuses by Cardinal Bernard Law who knowingly shuffled Geoghan through different parishes. The original article was followed-up by subsequent reports addressing different aspects of the scandal in Boston. The Boston Globe journalists who broke this story were the subject of the 2015 film *Spotlight*. See, Michael Rezendes, "Clergy allowed abuse by priest for years," *The Boston Globe*, January 6, <https://www.bostonglobe.com/news/special-reports/2002/01/06/church-allowed-abuse-priest-for-years/cSHfGkTlrAT25qKGvBuDNM/story.html>.

3 Derek Farrell, "An Historical Viewpoint of Sexual Abuse Perpetrated by Clergy and Religious," *Journal of Religion & Abuse* 6, no. 2 (September 21, 2004): 41–80, [https://doi.org/10.1300/J154v06n02\\_04](https://doi.org/10.1300/J154v06n02_04). 4

4 Emily St James, "The Sexual Abuse Scandal Rocking the Southern Baptist Convention, Explained," *Vox*, June 7, 2022, <https://www.vox.com/culture/23131530/southern-baptist-convention-sexual-abuse-scandal-guide-post>.



impropriety by its leader, Sakyong Mipham Rinpoche, against many of his followers.<sup>5</sup> This is not the first set of harmful allegations of abuse within the Shambhala community; former leader Osel Tendzin is well-known for having had unprotected sex with many members of the community while knowingly infected with AIDS.<sup>6</sup> Andrea Winn, a survivor of child sexual abuse in her sangha, created “Buddhist Project Sunshine,” a three-part report detailing the intergenerational abuse that has occurred within the Shambhala community.<sup>7</sup> These and many other recent examples, from small religious movements to spaces of neoliberal spirituality, show that abuse does not discriminate among religious and spiritual communities.

The revelation of these events has been met with shame, horror, and shock. Public responses range from a broad condemnation of “organized religion” in general to the criticism of specific religious traditions. But the fact that abuse occurs across religious traditions demonstrates that abuse occurs and must be studied as a larger issue of religion in general. Terms like religious abuse, spiritual abuse, and religious trauma have been created in order to provide a categorization and diagnosis of abusive treatment that could be experienced in any spiritual or religious setting, empowering survivors to recognize certain behaviors and treatments as abuse.

These terms provide fertile ground to study the abuse that occurs in religious settings. Some scholars, practitioners and activists have turned to comparative forms of analysis to help

explain the seemingly ubiquitous presence of abuse in spiritual and religious spaces. But while it may be possible to compare similarities in the ways in which abuse was hidden by top authorities within the SBC and the Catholic Church, it would be much more difficult to compare how these different groups responded to such abuse due to the very different organizational structures of these religions.<sup>8</sup> Furthermore, one may be tempted to compare how clerical vows of celibacy within both the Catholic and Buddhist traditions may be factors in the sexual transgressions of its leaders, but the ways in which sexual abuse may be interpreted by followers of these traditions vary due to their cultural positioning (for example, secular values or “Western” orientation). Abuse in a religious setting is unique to the tradition and cultural context in which it happens and exists along a spectrum from emotional and psychological abuse to physical and sexual abuse.

In the past three decades, discussions of spiritual and religious abuse have been taken up by survivors, former religious leaders, the press, psychologists and counselors, and religious studies scholars. But, if anything, more questions and complications have been raised. The study of abuse in spiritual and religious settings is incredibly complex and requires the consideration of other intersecting issues and topics such as domestic violence, child abuse, theological reasoning and justification, colonial legacies, issues of power, the role of scholars, and methods for healing and responding to these forms of abuse. Many survivors, counselors, and schol-

---

5 Andy Newman, “The ‘King’ of Shambhala Buddhism Is Undone by Abuse Report,” July, 11, 2018, <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/07/11/nyregion/shambhala-sexual-misconduct.html>.

6 Katy Butler, “Encountering the Shadow in Buddhist America,” May/June 1990, [https://info-buddhism.com/Encountering\\_the\\_Shadow\\_in\\_Buddhist\\_America\\_Katy-Butler.html](https://info-buddhism.com/Encountering_the_Shadow_in_Buddhist_America_Katy-Butler.html).

7 Andrea Winn, “BPS Welcome Page - <https://Andreamwinn.com/Offerings>,” Boulder Project Sunshine, accessed October 23, 2022, <https://andreamwinn.com/offerings/bps-welcome-page/>.

8 St James, “The Sexual Abuse Scandal Rocking the Southern Baptist Convention.”



ars have started public organizations, groups, and forums in search of more information and grounded research on these issues. Some of these include Buddhist Project Sunshine, Bishop-Accountability.org, the Religious Trauma Institute, Religious Trauma: North American Research Collective, Reclamation Collective, and the Global Center for Religious Research (GCRR). In addition to the organizations focused on research and awareness, there has been a proliferation of committees and organizations specifically focused on survivor-centered advocacy work and support for survivors of clergy sexual abuse. Some of these include: Survivors Network of those Abused by Priests (commonly known as SNAP), Faith Trust, Inform, and An Olive Branch.<sup>9</sup> These organizations aim to provide survivors with resources and information about why clergy sexual misconduct takes place and mediation tools to strengthen organizational health for leaders and their religious communities.

This thesis will use two conferences on religious trauma hosted by GCRR as case studies, which have served as starting points for a larger examination of spiritual and religious abuse and religious trauma. The inspiration for this thesis and the questions which drove my research centered on four things: (1) definitions (Who is creating the definitions for spiritual and religious abuse? Who is included and who is left out of these definitions?); (2) manifestations of spiritual and religious abuse (Why does this happen? What do spiritual and religious abuse, and religious trauma look like? Who does spiritual abuse and religious trauma affect?); (3) suggestions for healing (Are people being advised to turn towards or away from religion

for healing?); and (4) the holes in the current scholarship and literature (What is missing from these conversations? Whose voices are being privileged?).

In this thesis I will argue, through a descriptive overview of the field, that the present literature on spiritual abuse and religious trauma is largely limited to and based in Protestant experiences even though the definitions of spiritual abuse and religious trauma are generalized to all religious traditions. This is evidenced by the contrasting approach of religious studies scholars who have focused their research on the particularities of abuse in specific religious traditions. Additionally, I will argue that the Native American concepts and legacies of historical trauma and historical unresolved grief should be included in an analysis of spiritual abuse and religious trauma because while unique to a Native American experience, these experiences fit many of the criteria of spiritual abuse but have been completely excluded from the literature. Finally, I will problematize the suggestions for healing from spiritual abuse and religious trauma, which in some cases are forms of culturally appropriative behavior and have the potential to create further spiritual harm to Native populations.

Chapter One includes an overview and summary of the presentations from two conferences on religious trauma put on by GCRR. Chapter Two includes an overview of the secondary literature in the fields of spiritual abuse and religious trauma through a chronological exploration of definitions and understandings of terminology around spiritual abuse and religious trauma. This section attempts to address what abuse in a spiritual and/or religious

---

9 “Survivors Network of Those Abused by Priests,” Survivors Network of those Abused by Priests, accessed November 7, 2022, <https://www.snapnetwork.org/>. “Our Mission and Guiding Principles,” FaithTrust Institute, accessed November 7, 2022, <https://www.faithtrustinstitute.org/about-us/guiding-principles/>; “Inform,” inform, October 25, 2022, <https://inform.ac/>; “An Olive Branch Strengthens Organizations by Helping Leaders Understand the Role of Conflict in Organizational Health,” An Olive Branch, accessed November 7, 2022, <https://www.an-olive-branch.org/>.

context looks like, who is affected by it, why it is a unique form of injury for those who experience it, and what the suggestions are for healing. Finally, Chapter Three critiques the current research in the area. It provides a brief literature review for religion and abuse in the field of religious studies, a discussion of indigenous forms of trauma and abuse like historical trauma and

historical unresolved grief, and problematizes current spiritual abuse and religious trauma definitions and Western-oriented healing modalities and suggestions.

[...]