

# Table of Contents

|                                   |    |
|-----------------------------------|----|
| Preface and Acknowledgments ..... | ix |
| Executive Summary .....           | xi |

## I. Introduction

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <u>Chapter 1. <i>The New Watershed Source Book: Introduction and Overview</i></u> ..... | 1 |
| Information Featured in This Report .....   | 1 |
| Selection of Case Studies .....   | 2 |
| Regional Divisions .....  | 4 |
| Case Study Presentation .....   | 5 |
| Data Analysis and Special Studies .....   | 5 |

## II. The Larger Context

|  |    |
|--|----|
| <u>Chapter 2. <i>The Western Watersheds Movement in Context</i></u> .....  | 7  |
| Introduction .....   | 7  |
| Regionalism .....  | 7  |
| Collaboration in the Era of Alternative Problem-Solving .....  | 10 |
| Conclusion: Resource Management in a New Century .....   | 13 |
| <br>   |    |
| <u>Chapter 3. <i>Legal and Administrative Framework Influencing Community-Based Conservation in the West</i></u> ..... | 15 |
| Introduction .....   | 15 |
| Major Laws Governing Decision-Making Processes .....   | 16 |
| Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) .....  | 16 |
| National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) .....   | 19 |
| Major Laws Governing Public Lands Planning and Management .....  | 23 |
| National Forest Management Act (NFMA) .....  | 23 |
| Federal Land Policy and Management Act (FLPMA) .....   | 24 |
| Key Regulatory Programs for Resources Protection .....   | 26 |
| Endangered Species Act (ESA) .....   | 26 |
| Clean Water Act (CWA) .....  | 31 |
| Other Potentially Relevant Federal Laws .....  | 33 |
| Wild and Scenic Rivers Act (WSRA) .....  | 33 |
| Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (CERCLA) .....                                   | 34 |
| Laws Pertaining to Agricultural Management .....   | 35 |
| The Prior Appropriation Doctrine .....   | 36 |
| Conclusion .....   | 37 |

### III. Directory and Case Studies

*Use the index at the back of the document to find page number listings for specific watershed initiatives and forestry partnerships.*

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <u>Chapter 4.</u> <i>Watershed Initiatives: Names and Contact Information</i> .....                  | 39  |
| Arkansas Region Contacts .....   | 40  |
| Colorado Groups .....  | 40  |
| Kansas Groups .....  | 41  |
| California-South Pacific Region Contacts .....   | 42  |
| Colorado Region Contacts .....   | 51  |
| Arizona Groups .....   | 51  |
| Colorado Groups .....  | 52  |
| Nevada Groups .....  | 54  |
| New Mexico Groups .....  | 55  |
| Utah Groups .....  | 55  |
| Wyoming Groups .....   | 56  |
| Columbia-North Pacific Region Contacts .....   | 57  |
| Idaho Groups .....   | 57  |
| Montana Groups .....   | 59  |
| Oregon Groups .....  | 60  |
| Washington Groups .....  | 68  |
| Wyoming Groups .....   | 72  |
| Great Basin Region Contacts .....  | 73  |
| Nevada Groups .....  | 73  |
| Utah Groups .....  | 73  |
| South Platte-Missouri Region Contacts .....  | 75  |
| Colorado Groups .....  | 75  |
| Kansas Groups .....  | 76  |
| Montana Groups .....   | 77  |
| South Dakota Groups .....  | 78  |
| Rio Grande Region Contacts .....   | 79  |
| Colorado Groups .....  | 79  |
| New Mexico Groups .....  | 79  |
| Texas Groups .....   | 80  |
| <br>   |     |
| <u>Chapter 5.</u> <i>Selected Watershed Initiatives in the Arkansas River Basin</i> .....            | 81  |
| <br>   |     |
| <u>Chapter 6.</u> <i>Selected Watershed Initiatives in the California-South Pacific Region</i> ..... | 89  |
| <br>   |     |
| <u>Chapter 7.</u> <i>Selected Watershed Initiatives in the Colorado Region</i> .....                 | 137 |
| <br>   |     |
| <u>Chapter 8.</u> <i>Selected Watershed Initiatives in the Columbia-North Pacific Region</i> .....   | 179 |
| <br>   |     |
| <u>Chapter 9.</u> <i>Selected Watershed Initiatives in the Great Basin Region</i> .....              | 277 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <u>Chapter 10.</u> <i>Selected Watershed Initiatives in the South Platte-Missouri Region</i> ..... | 289 |
| <u>Chapter 11.</u> <i>Selected Watershed Initiatives in the Rio Grande Region</i> .....            | 321 |
| <u>Chapter 12.</u> <i>Forestry Partnerships</i> .....  | 333 |
| Introduction .....   | 333 |
| Network and Information Sources .....  | 333 |
| National Network of Forest Practitioners (NNFP) .....  | 333 |
| Communities Committee .....  | 334 |
| Four Corners Sustainable Forestry Partnership .....  | 335 |
| Organizations Providing Policy Support .....   | 336 |
| Pinchot Institute for Conservation .....   | 337 |
| American Forests .....   | 337 |
| Society of American Forests (SAF) .....  | 338 |
| Case Studies .....   | 338 |

#### **IV. Data Analysis and Special Studies**

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <u>Chapter 13.</u> <i>A Statistical Snapshot of Western Watershed Initiatives</i> ..... | 355 |
| Introduction .....  | 355 |
| Data from the Source Book Case Studies .....  | 356 |
| General Characteristics of the Region of Concern .....                                  | 357 |
| Background and Scope of the Watershed Initiative.....                                   | 360 |
| Participation and Representation .....  | 362 |
| Organization and Process .....  | 364 |
| Budget .....  | 366 |
| Projects, Activities and Accomplishments.....   | 367 |
| Survey Data for Oregon Watershed Initiative Participants.....                           | 370 |
| General Impressions (Statements 1 to 23).....   | 371 |
| Process for Making Decisions (Question 24).....   | 379 |
| Rules of Membership (Questions 25 and 26).....  | 380 |
| Group Function (Questions 27 and 28).....   | 381 |
| Affiliations of Respondents (Questions/Statements 29 to 37).....                        | 382 |
| Group Meetings, Process Outcomes, and Related Observations.....                         | 385 |
| Group Formation (Questions/Statements 49 to 57) .....                                   | 389 |
| Variations Between Basins in the West .....   | 392 |
| Concluding Thought .....  | 397 |
| <u>Chapter 14.</u> <i>Issues of Appropriateness and Success</i> .....                   | 399 |
| Introduction .....  | 399 |
| The Issue of Success .....  | 399 |
| Defining Success .....  | 399 |
| Measuring Success .....   | 400 |
| Potentially Relevant Publications and Findings .....                                    | 402 |
| The “Lessons Learned” Literature .....  | 402 |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| Academic Publications .....   | 404        |
| Satisfaction of Participants .....  | 407        |
| Concluding Thought .....  | 411        |
| <b>Chapter 15. <i>A Closer Look: The Case of the Animas River Stakeholder Group</i></b> ..... | <b>413</b> |
| Introduction .....  | 413        |
| An Overview of the Animas River Stakeholders Group .....                                      | 413        |
| Focus of the Stakeholders Group .....   | 414        |
| The Challenge of AMD Pollution .....  | 415        |
| Structure and Functioning of the Stakeholders Group .....                                     | 417        |
| Key Attributes and Issues Pertaining to Group Structure and Function .....                    | 419        |
| Accomplishments and Ongoing Activities .....  | 423        |
| Activities from 1995-1998 .....   | 423        |
| Initial Review of the Stakeholders Group in 1998 .....  | 425        |
| Current Activities .....  | 426        |
| Conclusion .....  | 427        |

## **V. Final Thoughts**

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Chapter 16. <i>Observations and Policy-Level Recommendations</i></b> .....   | <b>429</b> |
| Introduction .....  | 429        |
| Some Trends and Observations .....  | 429        |
| The Pacific Northwest: The Preeminent Laboratory of Experimentation .....       | 429        |
| A Growing Arsenal of Federal Hammers: Nonpoint Source Pollution and TMDLs ..... | 431        |
| Umbrella Groups .....   | 432        |
| Emerging Issues and Future Research .....                                       | 433        |
| Policy-Level Recommendations .....  | 435        |
| <b>Appendix A: The Watershed Survey</b> .....                                   | <b>437</b> |
| <b>Bibliography</b> .....   | <b>447</b> |
| Literature Cited .....  | 447        |
| Useful Websites for Watershed Initiative Research .....                         | 452        |
| <b>Index</b> .....  | <b>455</b> |

### List of Tables

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Table 13-1. Year of Group Formation .....   | 360 |
| Table 14-1. Summary of Arguments Raised to Defend and Challenge the Use of Watershed Initiatives in Natural Resource Management and Problem-Solving ..... | 401 |
| Table 14-2. Estimates of “Satisfaction” of 276 Watershed Initiative Participants in Oregon (adapted from Hart survey data, 1999) .....                    | 409 |
| Table 14-3. “Satisfaction Index” for 14 Populations of Watershed Initiative Participants in Oregon (adapted from Hart survey data, 1999) .....            | 410 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Table 16-1. Summary of the Eight Value-Scaled Questions Showing the Largest Variability (as Determined by Standard Deviation) in the Hart Survey of 276 Oregon Watershed Initiative Participants ..... | 434 |
|--|-----|

List of Figures

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Figure 4-1. U.S. Water Resource Regions .....   | 39  |
| Figure 5-1. Arkansas Region .....   | 81  |
| Figure 6-1. California-South Pacific Region .....   | 89  |
| Figure 7-1. Colorado Region .....   | 137 |
| Figure 8-1. Columbia-North Pacific Region .....   | 179 |
| Figure 9-1. Great Basin Region .....  | 277 |
| Figure 10-1. South Platte-Missouri Region .....   | 289 |
| Figure 11-1. Rio Grande Region .....  | 321 |
| Figure 13-1. Section of the Watershed With Which Groups are Concerned .....   | 357 |
| Figure 13-2. Number of Counties Within the Groups' Jurisdiction .....   | 357 |
| Figure 13-3. Population Distribution of the Watershed .....   | 358 |
| Figure 13-4. Approximate Population of Watershed Area .....   | 358 |
| Figure 13-5. Economic Diversification of the Watershed .....  | 359 |
| Figure 13-6. Strength of the Local Economy .....  | 359 |
| Figure 13-7. Entity(ies) Responsible for Watershed Group Formation .....  | 360 |
| Figure 13-8. Environmental Problems Within the Watersheds .....   | 361 |
| Figure 13-9. Institutional Problems Within the Watersheds .....   | 361 |
| Figure 13-10. Source of Groups' Participants .....  | 362 |
| Figure 13-11. Source of Groups' Federal Participants .....  | 363 |
| Figure 13-12. Can Anyone Join the Group? .....  | 363 |
| Figure 13-13. Organization of the Watershed Groups .....  | 364 |
| Figure 13-14. Frequency of Meetings .....   | 364 |
| Figure 13-15. Group Decision-Making .....   | 365 |
| Figure 13-16. Current Annual Budget of the Watershed Groups .....   | 366 |
| Figure 13-17. Sources of Watershed Group Funding .....  | 366 |
| Figure 13-18. Activities Undertaken or Planned by the Groups .....  | 367 |
| Figure 13-19. Groups' Level of Success in Addressing Natural Resource Issues .....  | 367 |
| Figure 13-20. Basis for Determining Groups' Success in Addressing Natural Resource Concerns .....                                       | 368 |
| Figure 13-21. Groups' Success in Addressing Institutional Problems .....  | 368 |
| Figure 13-22. Helpfulness of Federal, State, and Local Agencies .....   | 369 |
| Figure 13-23. Actions Necessary for Continued Problem-Solving .....   | 369 |
| Figure 13-24. <i>Statement 1</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated is well balanced .....                                | 371 |
| Figure 13-25. <i>Statement 2</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated uses an ineffective process to reach decisions .....  | 371 |
| Figure 13-26. <i>Statement 3</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated defines its membership in an appropriate manner ..... | 372 |
| Figure 13-27. <i>Statement 4</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated is effective .....                                    | 372 |
| Figure 13-28. <i>Statement 5</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated is  |     |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| disorganized .....  | 372 |
| Figure 13-29. <i>Statement 6</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated is not representative of interests in the watershed .....               | 373 |
| Figure 13-30. <i>Statement 7</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated gives fair consideration to dissenting opinions .....                   | 373 |
| Figure 13-31. <i>Statement 8</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated addresses difficult or controversial issues .....                       | 373 |
| Figure 13-32. <i>Statement 9</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated fails to address issues in a timely manner .....                        | 374 |
| Figure 13-33. <i>Statement 10</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated has adequate financial support .....                                   | 374 |
| Figure 13-34. <i>Statement 11</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated provides useful recommendations to decision makers .....               | 374 |
| Figure 13-35. <i>Statement 12</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated has not improved physical conditions in the watershed .....            | 375 |
| Figure 13-36. <i>Statement 13</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated has the participation of key decision making groups .....              | 375 |
| Figure 13-37. <i>Statement 14</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated has a positive impact on decisions of other key groups .....           | 375 |
| Figure 13-38. <i>Statement 15</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated has a positive impact on government decisions .....                    | 376 |
| Figure 13-39. <i>Statement 16</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated facilitates effective exchange of viewpoints on watershed issues ..... | 376 |
| Figure 13-40. <i>Statement 17</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated has inadequate staff support .....                                     | 376 |
| Figure 13-41. <i>Statement 18</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated has effective leadership .....   | 377 |
| Figure 13-42. <i>Statement 19</i> : The watershed group with which I am associated contributes to trust among participants .....                          | 377 |
| Figure 13-43. <i>Statement 20</i> : Government decision makers are unwilling to bring decisions and plans to the watershed group .....                    | 377 |
| Figure 13-44. <i>Statement 21</i> : Government decision makers have improved relationships with the public as a result of this effort .....               | 378 |
| Figure 13-45. <i>Statement 22</i> : Government decision makers are willing to be influenced by the group .....  | 378 |
| Figure 13-46. <i>Statement 23</i> : Government decision makers do not play an active role in the group .....  | 378 |
| Figure 13-47. <i>Question 24</i> : Please identify the process used by the group for reaching decisions .....   | 379 |
| Figure 13-48. <i>Question 25</i> : Please identify how membership is determined .....   | 380 |
| Figure 13-49. <i>Question 26</i> : If you checked RESTRICTED above, please check all restrictions that apply .....  | 380 |
| Figure 13-50. <i>Question 27</i> : Please identify the primary focus of the group .....   | 381 |
| Figure 13-51. <i>Question 28</i> : Please identify the category [of participant role definitions] you consider yourself in .....                          | 381 |
| Figure 13-52. <i>Question 29</i> : Check a single box that best describes your role as a  |     |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| participant in the watershed group .....   | 382 |
| Figure 13-53. <i>Statement 30</i> : I own land in the watershed .....  | 382 |
| Figure 13-54. <i>Statement 31</i> : I live in the watershed .....  | 383 |
| Figure 13-55. <i>Statement 32</i> : I consider myself a part of the timber industry .....                                      | 383 |
| Figure 13-56. <i>Statement 33</i> : I consider myself a part of the mining industry .....                                      | 383 |
| Figure 13-57. <i>Statement 34</i> : I consider myself a part of the agricultural industry .....                                | 384 |
| Figure 13-58. <i>Statement 35</i> : I consider myself a part o the recreation industry .....                                   | 384 |
| Figure 13-59. <i>Statement 36</i> : I consider myself a part of the environmental movement .....                               | 384 |
| Figure 13-60. <i>Statement 37</i> : I regularly use areas in the watershed for recreation .....                                | 385 |
| Figure 13-61. <i>Question 38</i> : Is your attendance part of your job responsibility? .....                                   | 385 |
| Figure 13-62. <i>Question 39</i> : How often do you attend watershed group meetings for this<br>group? .....                   | 385 |
| Figure 13-63. <i>Statement 40</i> : The group uses committees or subcommittees between<br>regular meetings .....               | 386 |
| Figure 13-64. <i>Statement 41</i> : Meetings conducted by this group are poorly attended .....                                 | 386 |
| Figure 13-65. <i>Statement 42</i> : Meetings are run in a manner that achieves meeting<br>objectives.....                      | 386 |
| Figure 13-66. <i>Statement 43</i> : Meetings conducted by this group are ineffective .....                                     | 387 |
| Figure 13-67. <i>Statement 44</i> : I feel I have ownership of the group’s decisions .....                                     | 387 |
| Figure 13-68. <i>Statement 45</i> : I do not support the concept of watershed groups .....                                     | 387 |
| Figure 13-69. <i>Statement 46</i> : Because of the group, I better understand issues in the<br>watershed .....                 | 388 |
| Figure 13-70. <i>Statement 47</i> : Because of the group, I better understand the perspectives of<br>others .....              | 388 |
| Figure 13-71. <i>Statement 48</i> : Participants in the group do not get along well with each<br>other .....                   | 388 |
| Figure 13-72. <i>Question 49</i> : Were you involved in forming the group? .....   | 389 |
| Figure 13-73. <i>Question 50</i> : The formation of this group was primarily initiated by [pick<br>one] .....                  | 389 |
| Figure 13-74. <i>Question 51</i> : How long did the group take to form? .....  | 389 |
| Figure 13-75. <i>Statement 52</i> : During its formation the group received financial assistance<br>to support formation ..... | 390 |
| Figure 13-76. <i>Statement 53</i> : During its formation the group received staff assistance to<br>support formation .....     | 390 |
| Figure 13-77. <i>Statement 54</i> : During its formation government entities provided assistance ..                            | 390 |
| Figure 13-78. <i>Statement 55</i> : During its formation the group used an independent party or<br>neutral facilitator .....   | 391 |
| Figure 13-79. <i>Statement 56</i> : During its formation the group had effective leadership .....                              | 391 |
| Figure 13-80. <i>Statement 57</i> : During its formation the effort to form the group was<br>efficient and effective .....     | 391 |
| Figure 13-81. Environmental Problems Within Watersheds by Basin .....  | 393 |
| Figure 13-82. Sources of Groups’ Participants by Basin .....   | 394 |
| Figure 13-83. Sources of Groups’ Federal Participants by Basin .....   | 395 |
| Figure 13-84. Current Annual Budget by Basin .....   | 396 |