

## Nationalism: Day 2

Though other issues vie for world attention – poverty, crime, disease, gender, ecological problems – ethnic conflicts and nationalisms remain the most ubiquitous, explosive, and intractable problems at the end of the twentieth century, and the greatest challenge to the framing of an international order based on justice and parity. (Hutchinson and Smith 1994: 11)

Attachments to territory are as old as human society, and there is little to suggest that the powerful ideological bonds that link identity, politics, and territory will be loosened. (Murphy 1996: 109)

### Three characteristics of nationalist movements

- H&S: autonomy, unity, identity
1. They are rooted in “identity politics”
  2. They seek control over territory
  3. They (usually) seek economic development

### 1. Identity Politics

- nationalism is about identity construction, and it competes with other national, religious, cultural and political identities for hegemony over the individual
- nationalist movements seek to establish the national identity as the primary identity among its members:
  - **pro patria mori**
- “the power, even primacy of national loyalties and identities over those of even class, gender, and race” (H&S: 4)
- a “terminal community – the largest community that, when the chips are down, effectively commands men’s loyalty” (Emerson, in Geertz: 29)

**2. Control Over Territory**

- the goal of nationalist movements is sovereignty (autonomy) for the “nation”
- the unification of the nation within a demarcated territory
- nationalism is a territorial ideology (Anderson 1986, in T&F: 233)

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**3. Economic Development**

Most nationalist movements seek:

- the advancement of the national unit
- to create an economic unit that is more competitive in the world-economy
- to secure economic benefits for the nation that are siphoned off by the state or colonial power

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**Clifford Geertz: primordial vs. civic nationalism**

- Both occur simultaneously, because people are driven by two motives:
  1. Search for an identity
  2. Demand for progress
- There is tension between these two:
  - the search for identity compels people toward primordial ties
  - the possibilities for social reform and material progress depend on their association with a reasonably large independent powerful polity, this compels people toward civic ties

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**Anthony Smith: modernist view (T&F: 195)**

- Nationalism is the merging of cultural identity with political demands; this is a modern phenomenon (Smith 1982)
- “The principle of nationality”: every nation has a right to its own state (Hobsbawm 1987)
- Wilson’s “right to national self-determination” (1918)
- T&F view nationalism as a political strategy, not as a primordialist phenomenon

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**The French Revolution**

- Birth of modern nationalism
1. Language used to define the nation
  2. Explicit link between nation and territory forged

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**The Modern Janus**

- Nationalism based on a series of myths: distorted histories concerning societal/ethnic origins, past heroic ages and betrayals, the special place of the nation in world history
- “getting its history wrong has always been a part of being a nation” (Hobsbawm 1990); creating nations involves creating histories (Dutch tartans, English kilts)
- Modern Janus: nations look backward to a mythical history for their identity, and forward to real political and economic goals; individuals are given identity in terms of where they have come from and where they are going

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## Nationalism in Practice

Five Basic Types of Nationalism (T&F: 204-5)

1. Proto-nationalism
2. Unification nationalism
3. Separation nationalism
4. Liberation nationalism
5. Renewal nationalism

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## Nation Against State

Three scales of national identity

- Each of these three can be either top-down (nationalism from above), or bottom-up (nationalism from below, or grassroots nationalism)
1. Minority Nationalism
  2. State Nationalism
  3. Supra-state Nationalism

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### 1. Minority Nationalism

- Sub-state national group, seeking either greater autonomy or secession from the state in which they live (separation nationalism)
- Identity formation is relatively complete, the goal is political autonomy
- Separation nationalism seeks to create a state out of a nation

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**2. State Nationalism**

- A state-sponsored response to various centrifugal forces (unification nationalism, renewal nationalism)
- Political autonomy has been won, the goal is to create a national identity that is based on the existing state boundaries
- Unification nationalism seeks to create a nation out of a state: banal nationalism

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**3. Supra-State Nationalism**

- The rarest and least successful
- Build or heighten a supra-state identity in order to win greater political or economic power

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**Nation Against State**

- Nation vs. state conflicts occur when a state fails to incorporate all its citizens within the national identity
- Dueling identities
- Competing national claims over territory:
  - State claims the territory occupied by the minority group as part of the state
  - Minority group claims the territory as its historical homeland: demands autonomy

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### **Main Reason for Nation vs. State Conflicts**

Uneven Development / Incomplete Modernization (Nairn)

- Modernization (economic development) not evenly spread across the state
- Separation nationalism is a reaction to the relative poverty of the periphery
- Modernization involves:
  - Migration to the core industrial areas of the state
  - Integration into wider processes that are out of local control
  - Alienation based on breakdown of tradition

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### **Nationalism as Counter-Development**

- Nationalism gives people back their traditional identity
- Nationalist movements promise economic development or autarky
- Nationalism compensates for the alienation of mass society

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### **Stasis in the International System**

- Article 2 of the U.N. Charter
- The illegality of Unilateral Declarations of Independence (UDI)
- The 1933 Montevideo Conventions on the Recognition of New States
  1. Clearly recognized boundaries
  2. Stable and well-defined population
  3. A government in control

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---